

# ANGEL OUTLINE & NOTES

Idea for theme:

Inner Conversations

Obvious Secret Success Technique

Learn to be aware of the inner conversation

Divide into useful inner conversation & unuseful

This is same as angel meditation & devil meditation

The 'dzin stangs (way these views see things) must contradict each other

Need to learn second husband

Learn to use sheshin (The Monitor) & drenpa (The Tour Guide) to monitor & correct, "draw attention to" a better item (something that works) on exhibition within the mind

Meditations: Choose a challenge in your life, think about solutions

Learn to divide angel solution from devil solution

A devil solution will not work, even in a million years

## Angel/Devil Outline by Verse

### Preliminaries

1 Descriptive title:

*This is an argument which occurred one time between Wisdom and her opponent, whose name was The Tendency to Think that Things are Real. It all started when Wisdom was identifying what the word "Mahamudra" meant, at three different stages in a person's life: in the way things normally are for them; in the way they are as this person practices the spiritual path; and as they are when the person reaches the fruit of their practice.*

2 Honoring Lama

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

**General description of Mahamudra**

- 3 Division of Mahamudra into three stages of evolution
- 4 First stage: Natural Mahamudra as primordial, misunderstanding mind
- 5 This misunderstanding cause of pain
- 6 Only wisdom that sees that nothing is itself can stop it
- 7 Natural Mahamudra is also clear light of death for all beings
- 8 One goal is to learn to use that clear light to attain that wisdom; that is Path Mahamudra
- 9 Path Mahamudra is also emptiness meditation
- 10 When that way of looking is perfect, that is Result Mahamudra, or Path of Seeing
- 11 Consolidation & increase of that understanding is Path of Habituation
- 12 When that understanding is free of obstacles to omniscience, it is Path of No More Learning
- 13 At that point we combine bliss & emptiness into Reality Body, which sends out a rainbow of Emanation Bodies

**Segue to the Devil**

- 14 Buddha bodies appear through *conditions*, of their compassion/prayers; wishes of disciples—therefore these bodies are not real
- 15 Thinking otherwise—that things are real—is the greatest mistake of all;

**The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes**

let us give it up! Devil, please leave.

**The Devil claims we need him**

16 The devil, Tendency To Think Things Are Real, makes his appearance in conversation [this is not just in meditation; goes on all day as we try to solve challenges & reach goals in mistaken way]

17 Devil: I have been your mind's companion since it has ever existed; don't argue with someone who has always taken care of you [I find solutions; I make decisions; I work towards goals]

18 D: I am like your mom & dad; I get you food, clothes! [Work, competition]

19 D: I brought you the real Dharma you are committed to: three poisons; I helped you stop wasting time on good deeds

**The Angel objects to this: things which never existed cannot have helped us**

20 Angel of Wisdom makes her appearance

21 A: *What* mind have you accompanied? [The one you see] never existed! [Husband 2]

22 A: In ultimate sense, you yourself never existed. *Who* cared for *whom*? Leave!

**Devil's clever response: you are a nihilist! (sophisticated response)**

23 Devil responds

24 D: You Angel don't exist either [ultimately]! So whose side are you on? You're the one who says no atom of self-existence in universe; how can anything come or go? [How could I even leave?]

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

25 D: I do exist, nominally. If you deny me, you underestimate reality, and fall off into the extreme that nothing exists!

26 D: The workings of things are real, and I influence all of them; *you* should leave!

27 D: We here are Things Working Nominally. You cannot stay, because you are Nothing Exists Ultimately. [Actually these two ideas are very consistent with each other.]

**Angel: but your understanding of cause & effect is  
posited on self-existent causes & effects**

28 Angel responds

29 A: You are not just not here ultimately; you are not even here nominally. Nor are all dependent things, the workings of things, even here. [Technically this is not true; here is Her clarification:]

30 A: You think dependence, cause & effect, is made of self-existent pieces; so even your nominal working of things is non-existent [you agree that the pen is non-self-existent but you still think things & people in relationships are acting that way; diff between Arya Nagarjuna Ch 1 & Ch 2: things & people]

31 A: Your cause & effect could never change, would exist in & of itself

32 A: It would be fixed, concrete, self-standing, immutable, never stopping

33 A: If you lived in the midst of such causes they could never apply to you anyway

34 A: Things cannot depend on others, and not at same time; the way you see things, & the way I see things, are irreconcilable

35 A quotation from *Commentary on Valid Perception* with same intent

36 Master Shantideva on how we must be able to picture what's not there

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

(2<sup>nd</sup> husband)

37 Master Chandrakirti's commentary to *400 Verses* on self-nature =  
a quality where a thing never relied on something else

38 A: Therefore we are incompatible, and you must leave

**Devil: I am part & parcel with the mind, I should stay;  
karma put me here, and cannot be contravened, by anyone**

39 Devil responds

40 D: I have lived in your heart forever; nowhere to go; have mercy, let me stay

41 D: You cannot live without me, I get you things [competition, hard work]

42 D: I also get you friends; without me, you will be friendless [looking for  
a partner online, or at a club]

43 D: Big mistake to think the mind should switch to a new companion

44 D: I have blessed this mind; no one in many years past has managed  
to kick me out, although they have threatened me countless times

45 D: My blessings so strong that warriors carry me still up to 7<sup>th</sup> bodhisattva level

46 D: And my stain continues up to 10<sup>th</sup> level; so what need say how I stay  
inside normal people?

47 D: Miss Wisdom you only visit occasionally; I am permanent resident.  
Don't try to fight me

48 D: Forget kicking me out; I am constantly bringing in more extended  
family: jealousy, refusing to share, deceit, pretending to be someone  
that we are not, pride, mistaken views etc etc

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

49 D: I am the permanent confidante; you are a flash in a pan—you should be the one to leave

50 D: Don't paint me as a monster with horns; don't talk of forcing me away from warm hearth & home [be merciless with him!]

51 D: After all, karma put me here; who are you to deny karma? Not even Buddhas can fight karma

**Angel: Your very presence, if it continued, would prove that your view of things is mistaken, and you will die!**

52 Angel responds

53 A: You are riding on donkey & looking for lost donkey. The way you've appeared in this mind contradicts your staying; we *are*, still, incompatible

54 A: The Buddha is inherent in all minds, opposite of you; just veiled

55 A: You have made yourself a monster; you will have to be homeless as long as I am here (no mercy to misunderstanding)

**Clear reasonings used to prove emptiness**

**1) Emptiness of parts & wholes of a static whole**

56 A: If you insist on staying, here is clear reasoning for you; even you will agree to tear your house down by the time I'm finished [reasoning can use a self-existent state of mind to see Truth]

57 A: Neither the static combination of your parts, or the parts of the stream of yourself, are self-existent you

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

58 A: You are neither your parts individually, nor their combination

59 A: Neither are they you; neither are you you!

**2) Emptiness of parts & whole of a stream**

60 A: Stream of you is not combination of moments; these have no start or end point

61 A: Regardless of how we deconstruct things there is no self-nature to any of it

**Angel: These are killers at killing points; emptiness sings to us from an echo (this is pretty much an accurate description of Mahamudra, and 26 wrong descriptions follow; classic wrong views of various non-Buddhist & Buddhist siddhanta will follow that)**

62 A: Illusion is torn; root is ripped out; poison tree is felled [striking points, *marma hata*]

63 A: The king of all negativity [misunderstanding] is dead, root of all evil severed

64 A: None of these negativities ever started; they have been never for forever

65 A: That nature of the mind is that it never had any nature within it

66 A: This is the thing beyond all speaking or thinking

67 A: This is the antidote which fixes itself etc (Sw: even the reasoning for emptiness, which we can have while we see things as self-existent, is finally seen to be coming from us)

68 A: This is the single song of all things, the cycle & freedom both

69 A: To this state of mind (in the direct perception; or which cannot detect a

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

self-existent version of something) there is no Buddha or Dharma or Sangha, much less Devil

70 A: In the aftermath, something of you may appear but no one believes it

71 A: Unexamined, the world is fine, like a reflection in a mirror, when conditions convene

72 A: Cause & effect is a play of names [images from karmic seeds]

73 A: If you dig beyond those names you will find nothing [seeds without images]

74 A: To us causality seems real, even as we recognize it depends on conditions itself; and our belief exhausts us

75 A: Boys were old men from the day of their birth; we mis-see them as otherwise; and all things similarly [Sw: this seems to be a deceptive reality recognition of subtle impermanence; the gakja is a boy who doesn't change moment by moment]

76 A: Working of things like clouds of illusion in emptiness raining things down; [conditions convene for a direct perception of emptiness]

77 A: Rain & things come & go, return to empty sky

78 A: Same with our dream-body

79 A: In time we see how things exist this way, as images from seeds in mind

80 A: Things appear & disappear from our life but only images doing that

81 A: The reflection of the moon of wisdom appears in still water of emptiness in the mind

82 A: And when it does, we see how things really are; only nominal

83 A: You can keep checking elsewhere for things going on but not there, only in mind [seeds]

**The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes**

84 A: Even these teachings are an echo of our own seeds

85 A: Because causes & conditions are complete, emptiness sings back to us

86 A: We learn & study emptiness from our own seeds

87 A: There is no one place in the universe where both of us could stay together; so Leave! [note: this is the last we hear from Angel in quite a while; the entire description of wrong meditations and why they are wrong, eloquent, is by the Devil]

**Devil: you are momentary, I am forever; look at these fools who try to do Mahamudra meditation!**

88 Devil responds

89 D: You chatter about emptiness, I *do* things, like send forth Eight Worldly Thoughts; yes, we are incompatible!

'JIG RTEN GYI CHOS BRGYAD NI, BSHES SPRINGS LAS, 'JIG RTEN MKHYEN  
PA RNYED DANG MA RNYED DANG, BDE DANG MI BDE SNYAN DANG MI  
SNYAN DANG, BSTOD SMAD CES BGYI 'JIG RTEN CHOS BRGYAD PO, ,ZHES  
GSUNGS PA LTAR RO,,

90 D: I am Meru; you are fleeting; I am the inner circle

91 D: You are a flash of lightning, I am the sea

92 D: You are the blink of an eye, I am a mother's love for her child

**Segue to Mahamudra meditation versions**

The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes

93 D: Some people say they will meditate and kick me out; they say, "I will meditate on the mind as it really is"

\$\$\$\$stopped here 11 17 18

**A list of 26 ineffective meditations  
posing as Mahamudra**

94 D: **Ineffective meditation #1: no hopes no reminiscence**; meditate on mind with no complications or additions (like a Present Moment Meditation);

95 D: But this is just a meditation on consciousness, **and currently that = misunderstanding** [this theme is repeated]

96 D: They are not meditating on you Angel, so it doesn't damage me; **in fact I have never met you in such a meditation** [this theme will also be repeated]

97 D: **Ineffective meditation #2: Empty the mind**; no incompatibility, no damage; never seen you there, either

98 D: **Ineffective meditation #3: Explore how mind is not physical**; mistake that for emptiness; no damage, no you

99 D: **Ineffective #4: Naked mind, raw, untouched, as is**: no damage or you; just a meditation on awareness

100 D: **Ineffective #5: Let mind ramble**; no damage, no you; in no way antidotal

101 D: **Ineffective #6: Uneducated meditation; "meeting mind face to face"**; does not distinguish between seeking misunderstanding or existence [I guess, of the mind]

102 D: **Ineffective #7: Pretend misunderstanding doesn't exist**, hide under blanket with it in your mind

103 D: These meditations are my holy deeds! You are never there for a moment. Saying you will drive me out is a joke!

The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes

104 D: **Ineffective #8: Analysis, but only on disproving others' views about misunderstanding**

105 D: **Or overanalyze the analyzing;** no application

106 D: **Or infinite regression of analyzing,** never a conclusion

**Intermission comments**

107 D: Summary of wrong meditation objects: just mind (with its component misunderstanding); or nothing at all; or mind thinking on nothing; and so real meditation incompatible with misunderstanding as rare as daytime star

108 D: You are rare as cobalt lotus: if you come in mind it is an accident caused by blessing of being around a real Lama

109 D: I am the resident lord; only unmistakable wisdom can touch this position

110 D: People avoid the real solutions; they befriend me; so they will never be free

**Back to wrong Mahamudras**

111 D: **Ineffective #9: No conceptions at all;** "this idea is so bad I can't stop laughing at it"

112 D: **Ineffective #10: The "loka" or shining/bright nature of awareness of reality** around us is the mind, and is emptiness of the mind; they say this is the illusion; but that is only deceptive nature of things, not emptiness

113 D: A good meditation would also realize how Devil is not real; that would nicely contradict the Devil

114 D: **Ineffective #11: Emptiness as space as the limitlessness like outer space;** no edges

The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes

115 D: Space is only edgeless because it is not physical; that idea doesn't touch me

116 D: With all these meditations "I continue my delightful dance in the mind"

117 D: **Ineffective #12: Watch thoughts pop out of nothing & just focus on them**

118 D: **Ineffective #13: When thought slips away that is Buddha's reality body;**  
so must mean that more random thoughts = more enlightened bodies!

119 D: Seeing that random thoughts & mind are not physical things doesn't hurt misunderstanding; joke to say it drives out that misunderstanding, or leads to reality body

120 D: **Ineffective #13: Decide things not one or many but don't apply to anything;**  
Devil remains

121 D: **Ineffective #14: Me is result of an image;** but don't continue on to no other Me; negation as what a thing is not, and not its absence

122 D: No opposition here to me; no damage to me

123 D: **Ineffective #15: Using one & many to come to lack of me but while still in the act of holding me** [seeing Pen as coming from its side during the explanation that it doesn't]

124 D: This is to have emptiness in front of us and not recognize it by applying to ourselves; so I have no choice but to remain in mind

125 D: **Ineffective #16: Do one & many and avoid taking any position;**  
wrong idea that this is what it means not to take a position

126 D: Strange idea to think that taking no position would hurt misunderstanding [Sw: could be applied to over-tolerance of views]

127 D: **Ineffective meditation #17: Overinterest in the flow of thinking that led to the conclusion of one & many;** meditating on that flow instead

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

- 128 D: This is meditating on mind as deceptive reality; it is not absolute reality; in essence you are making mind/misunderstanding your pal
- 129 D: **Ineffective meditation #18: Use one & many to see that me is not real, but again not using that, just reviewing the thought-flow** [study with no application]
- 130 D: Studying the thought-flow is not seeing emptiness, even if that thought-flow finally understood no me
- 131 D: **Ineffective #19: Starting to focus on no-me but still not applying that really to my life** and my challenges
- 132 D: "This puts you uniquely far away from emptiness"
- 133 D: Because looking for emptiness of anything other than me & my life challenges  
Sw: trepto, got used to ideas of emptiness & not applying
- 134 D: **Useless #20: Staying on fact that me myself is not self-existent and trying to understand the emptiness of that thought process:**  
wrong but not bad, getting close [that thought process is part of "me"]
- 135 D: Inflicts though only minor damage; does not smash me
- 136 D: Even this mind is focusing on parts of me convened and feeling me from its own side, in the middle of one & many
- 137 D: This is insidious because this feeling-tendency follows all the way up to bodhisattva level 10
- 138 D: Bodhisattvas still see self-existence in aftermath, although not in direct perception; Buddhas beyond this distinction of direct & aftermath; normal people see s-e in meditation & out of meditation
- 139 D: "Me" feeling comes automatically when look at sum of parts of body & mind [when look at person we're having trouble with]
- 140 D: Again, only small damage if we get caught up in the meditation

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

flow on how these parts are not whole [without luminous image]

141 D: Must see how “I” is based on body & mind [with luminous image]  
or I will “dance atop your mind”

142 D: But this is not to think that the “me” is divorced from body & mind  
[Sw: as in soul idea, a separate entity]; that’s also not a contradiction  
to how I see things

143 D: Only when you see that “me” cannot exist without the luminous  
image are you doing damage to misunderstanding

144 D: Have to reach the feeling of a simple absence [lack of a Discovery  
credit card in my pocket]

145 D: Also need to maintain quality of meditation while doing this;  
then you will come to see no “me” [without luminous image];  
and that is real emptiness meditation [weird that Devil advising us here!]

146 D: To maintain this meditation on a regular basis would hurt me,  
but “rare as a star shining bright shining bright in the middle of the day  
[interesting to take this to last verse of Diamond Cutter]

147 D: I’m on everyone’s mind all day but nobody recognizes me;  
like putting an offering to a spirit outside the wrong door

148 D: Shooting arrow at a target with a blindfold on; don’t know who I am

149 D: They are digging for jewels that they don’t know what color etc;  
“Wisdom, you are someone no one ever meets; I am Master of the Universe”

150 D: **Ineffective #21: I am simply easy to keep thinking about;** even when people  
think up logic to kick me out, it is comfortable for them to maintain a flow  
of my presence

[rnam bdun rigs pas dpyad pa is mentioned here; an explanation from  
“grags pa bshad grub” in uncat data, this appears to be closely related

The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes

to the wagon analysis:  
DGAG BYA'I BDAG NI

(1) PHUNG DANG GCIG NYID 1 MIN, ,@006B

(2) RANG BZHIN GYIS KYANG THA DAD YOD MIN 2 ZHING, ,

(3) PHUNG BO RNAMS DANG RANG BZHIN GYIS 3 MI LDAN, ,

(4) PHUNG POR RANG BZHIN GYIS NI BR TEN 4 MA YIN, ,

(5) PHUNG RNAMS DE LA'ANG DE LTAR BR TEN 5 PA MIN, ,

(6) PHUNG PO'I TSOGS 6 PA BDAG MIN

(7) DBYIBS MA 7 YIN, ,

RNAM BDUN RIGS PAR DBU MA'I GZHUNG NAS BSHAD]

151 D: They focus on sustaining view with stream of mind and so focus on misunderstanding

152 D: The idea that—because the mind is involved in the deception—it has no nature does slight damage to me, but not total

153 D: **Ineffective #22: That the idea that we cancel [other] things to see something—the absence of other—could hurt misunderstanding** [ma yin pa las log pa idea] [this is a segue to misunderstandings of the term “space-like”; go to the four spaces, only one of which is emptiness]

154 D: Similarly flaccid idea to thinking emptiness is space’s lack of physicality [which comes just below]

155 D: **Ineffective #23: Basic error of taking “space-like” to mean the blue sky; joke!**

156 D: **Ineffective #24: Error of taking “space-like” to mean lack of physicality**

The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes

[Sw: = location]

157 D: Sustaining that perception of empty space is not sustaining a viewpoint which contradicts misunderstanding

158 D: **Ineffective #25: How is the absence of s/e something sustained? Is it one thing, or multiple, in a flow? [this is a question from the Devil; seems to say: Even if emptiness did exist, how could it be sustained? How do you sustain an absence over time?]**

159 D: Empty space is the cancellation of gross material form; how is emptiness sustained? [this seems to segue into the sustaining of the perception of it]

160 D: **Ineffective #26: The understanding of that absence without sustained meditational attention;** this becomes “absence of a particular thing” [over time, if you do sustain, with shamatha]

161 D: When people “grind down” and get to the end of their meditative analysis they become vulnerable to Devil’s influence: sleepiness, dullness, lack of clarity, lack of vivid thinking, loss of mental strength; cloudiness, spacing out, agitation, jumping to the outside; constant distraction

162 D: Frazzled thoughts are a great breeding ground for misunderstanding [for dropping out of a perception of emptiness]

163 D: Need to join shamatha to the vipashyana: need to be able to use the shamatha to sustain the vipashyana

164 D: Staying glued to that gakja vividly without mental degrading; then we would call you a Master

165 D: Chances of that happening are close to zero. We are too busy mentally. Better for Wisdom to stay asleep in the back room of the mind.

166 D: Closes up section on why most people who claim they will banish misunderstanding are actually never hurting him; “these then

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

are the reasons why I will stay”

**Viewpoints of the schools**

**Critique of spaced-out meditations (non-Buddhist)**

167 D: All people are subjects of King Misunderstanding. They get distracted easily by desire, distraction, etc etc. He owns us

168 D: All people divided into those attempting spiritual understanding and those who could care less. The former are rare, but among those, the ones who are not on a [true] path are numerous

169 D: Those attempting but not on a true path are two types: some say things never change, some say they never were. Almost all reject past & future lives at all; so no freedom, and no protection [these are the “Outcasts,” or Mimansa school of ancient India]

170 D: Some accept a future life but no freedom [from negative emotions] there. Some accept freedom but no omniscience. Those also believe an unchanging entity created this changing world. [Sankhya school]

171 D: These schools can attain the four concentration levels; clairvoyance; miracles; but not Mastery at Path of Preparation [free from future lower births, realize pen & person emptiness]; not even Warmth or Peak [basic pen]

172 D: Think that stopping feelings & discrimination, thinking, is a path; result is just doing nothing

173 D: This kind of meditation can go on for millions of years with no result [like trying to solve your problems without using emptiness]

174 D: Thrown into doubt about whether discrimination even really exists; decide not to decide; but this cannot touch misunderstanding

**The Devil Debates An Angel**  
**Outline & Notes**

175 D: This can lead to lack of conception of physicality [and just go to formless realm]

176 D: True you get free of two kinds of suffering, but only because conditions for them are incomplete; you will drop back; not remotely damaging to misunderstanding; just the view of the formless realm

**Critique of lower Buddhist meditations**

177 D: Most well-known meditations in the world are directly meditating upon misunderstanding; none of these has ever seen misunderstanding leave the mind

178 D: You need an antidote like a light in the dark; there must be mutual exclusivity

179 D: **Abhidharma system:** deconstruct until things disappear; but you are still in the mind at that point, and still in misunderstanding

180 D: Emptiness is not to deconstruct things to atoms and in that way lose the whole

181 D: With this meditation, you can walk through walls; but no freedom

182 D: Gaining those powers is not freedom; don't be deceived; "you are only fulfilling the Devil's dreams"

183 D: There is some benefit to these meditations but we must stay aware that that is not ultimate benefit; it just gets us hoping for higher ones

184 D: If you get to where you understand things are not real, but then believe that things then don't work, "You have joined my [Devil's] school!"

185 D: **This is a Sutrist level;** where still you cannot reach even Warmth or Peak, much less Mastery

**The Devil Debates An Angel  
Outline & Notes**

**End Sedona program 11 18**