# Stepping into Our Next World

Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil" Spring 2022

We continue with our study of the epic poem entitled "The Angel Debates the Devil," written by His Holiness the First Panchen Lama, Lobsang Chukyi Gyeltsen, some 400 years ago—

# How can a pleasure being die?

,LHA YI TSE DANG DPAL 'BYOR SOGS, ,'DOD YON BDEN PAR GRUB SNANG BA, ,DE NI THOG MA MED PA NAS, ,KHO RANG LTOS MED GRUB GRUB PA, ,'GYUR MED RTAG PAR SDOD PAS NA, ,'CHI DANG TSE 'PHO GA LA SRID,

And The Angel continued:

241 The lifetime of the pleasure being— And all their glory, And all their possessions, All the objects of their senses— Would appear to exist In reality.

Those then for time With no beginning

Would have to have existed Without depending On a single other thing.

And that would make them Things that could never change; Things that remained there Forever the same.

How then could it be possible For this person to ever die, Or move on to another life?

# ,'CHI DANG TSE 'PHO SRID ZER NA, ,RANG TSUGS THUB PAR MA GYUR PAS, ,'GYUR BA MED PA'I BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

242

And suppose you insist: "Yet it is a fact That people do die, And move on to Another birth."

Well since in that case They would no longer be Things that stand on their own, It would become a contradiction To continue to insist That they existed "in reality," In a nature immutable.

## How can our senses be replaced?

,LHA LUS BDEN PAR GRUB PA NA, ,'GRO BA GZHAN DU SKYE BA'ANG MED, ,'DOD PA'I YON TAN LNGA PO YANG, ,LHA MO'I GZUGS LA CHAGS PA YI, ,CHAGS PA BDEN PAR SNANG BA YI, ,SNANG BA GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR BAS, ,SGRA SOGS 'DOD YON BZHI PO LA, ,CHAGS PA CI YI PHYIR NA SKYE, ,SKYE NA GZUGS LA BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

## 243

If the body of a pleasure being Really did exist in truth, Then they could never take A rebirth as another Type of being.

And the five objects Of the senses— Appearing as they do To the attachment to Their heavenly form As if they existed in truth— Could never start appearing To be some other way.

In that case then How could anyone Begin to feel attachment To the other four objects Of the senses— Sound and all the rest?

If they did, then it Would clearly be a contradiction For the colors and shapes They'd already been focusing on To have existed in reality.

# How could we love our loved ones?

,LHA YI BU MO LA DMIGS NAS, ,YID DU 'ONG BA'I BYAMS PA DE, ,LTOS MED BDEN PAR GRUB PAR SNANG, ,SNANG BA GZHAN 'GYUR MI SRID NA, ,LHA MA YIN DANG 'THAB PA'I TSE, ,ZHE SDANG SKYE BA DNGOS SU 'GAL, ,GAL TE ZHE SDANG SKYES PA NA, ,YID 'ONG BYAMS PA'I BDEN GRUB DE, ,LTOS MED 'GYUR BA MED PA 'GAL,

## 244

And when the beings of pleasure Gazed upon their daughters With that version of love That sees them as so lovely, That love would see What it sees in a way That depended on nothing else, As something truly there.

That way of things appearing Is something that could never Change to looking another way;

And that would directly contradict The fact that—when these beings Of pleasure battle with their cousins— Their feelings change to hatred.

If these pleasure beings Could begin to feel hate,

Then that would contradict The idea that their lovely love Existed in reality, And depended on nothing else.

# How could we hate our enemies?

,LHA MA YIN LA DMIGS PA YI, ,ZHE SDANG DRAG PO SKYES PA'I TSE, ,ZHE SDANG BDEN PAR SNANG BAS NA, ,'THAB MO GROL NAS RANG YUL DU, ,LHA MO LA NI BRTZE BA'I TSE, ,YID 'ONG RNAM PA SKYE BA MED, ,SKYE NA ZHE SDANG BDEN GRUB 'GAL, ,YID 'ONG DE YANG GSAR SKYE BAS, ,YID 'ONG BDEN [f. 248b] PAR GRUB PA 'GAL,

245

And yet when these beings Do look upon their cousins — The "almost pleasure beings" — And start to feel intense Feelings of hatred for them, That hatred itself Begins to look as if It too existed in reality.

When the wars then come To an end, And the pleasure beings return To their own lands, And the time too returns For them to look upon Those divine daughters

With thoughts of love That see them again as lovely, Well that would contradict The idea that their former hatred Had existed in reality.

And moreover, If this perception Of their daughters as lovable Could start afresh in their hearts, Then that in turn Would contradict the idea That the lovely love itself Existed in truth.

# If things are real, they could never exist

,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I LAG STABS 'DIS, ,CHOS RNAMS THAMS CAD MED PA 'DRA, ,BLO GCIG BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I NGOR, ,CHOS KUN SKYE 'GAG 'GRO 'ONG MED, ,THA SNYAD LAS 'BRAS THAMS CAD MED,

246

This method of implementing The concept that things Could exist in reality Is the same for every other Thing in the universe: They simply Could never exist!

If a single state of our mind Existed in and of itself,

Then none of the things In the whole universe That ever appeared to it Could ever start, or stop, Or go, or come.

Nor could karma And its consequences Even exist, Even in name.

,MDOR NA CHOS KUN MED PAR GO ,DE YI RGYU MTSAN CI STE NA, ,BDEN PAR 'DOD RNAMS CHOS KUN NI, ,LTOS MED GZHAN LA RAG MA LAS, ,KHO RANG NGO BOS GRUB PAR SNANG,

247

To put it briefly, Please understand, Everything that exists Would cease to exist.

And why is that?

Once you say That a thing exists in truth, Then it cannot rely Upon any other thing; It could never Be relative To anything else.

It would have to appear In the universe All on its own, in itself. ,'JIG RTEN THA SNYAD LA BSTUN PA'I, ,CHOS RNAMS THAMS CAD RGYU RKYEN DANG, ,PHAN TSUN LTOS BZHAG BLO BUR DU, ,RTOG PA'AM MING GIS BTAGS TZAM LA, ,GZHI GCIG STENG DU GNYIS KA NI, ,'DU BA'I SKABS CIG MA BYUNG BAS, ,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I PHYOGS LTAR NA, ,RKYEN LA LTOS PA'I CHOS KUN MED, ,DES NA CHOS KUN MED PA YIN,

248

Consider now These two ideas—

One, that things in the universe Generally match the way That they are spoken about In terms of the world at large:

They rely on their causes, And they rely on comparison One to the other.

Two, that they spring up All of a sudden; Products of nothing more Than mental pictures, And names.

These two ideas Could never convene And cooperate With regard to any Single object in the world.

If thinking thus we approach The position that things

Exist with some reality Of their own,

We would have to assert That there was no single thing In this entire universe That depended on conditions.

And then we'd have To go further, And say that nothing Existed at all.

# How things really are real

,NGA YI PHYOGS LA CHOS KUN NI, ,RGYU RKYEN RTEN 'BREL TSOGS LAS SKYE, ,DES NA CHOS KUN YOD PA YIN, ,LAS DANG 'BRAS BU MYONG BA YOD, ,SA DANG LAM DANG DKON MCHOG GSUM, ,THA SNYAD THAMS CAD BDAG LA YOD, ,DE YANG THA SNYAD TZAM DU YIN, ,BDEN PA'I DON DU KHYOD DANG 'DRA, ,CHOS KUN GTAN NAS MED PAR 'DOD,

249

Now my own position On all of this Is that everything there is Comes from the cooperation Of causes and conditions, And things depending On other things.

Then we can say That everything there is, is.

Karma and its consequences Are something we actually experience; And if you stick with me, You can keep your ideas Of spiritual levels, and spiritual paths, And all three of the Jewels— In my camp, all of them Are there, in their names.

But they are *only* there In names; If we take the expression "Existing in reality" The way you want us to,

Then nothing in the universe Could ever exist at all.

,KHYOD NI GTI MUG MA RIG PAS, ,CHOS KUN BDEN PAR KHAS BLANGS PAS, ,THA SNYAD DU YANG CHOS KUN NI, ,MED PAR SONG BA MA RIG PA, ,MA RIG LAS NI MA RIG PA, ,MA RIG DKYIL 'KHOR CHEN PO'O,

250

You are darkness, You are misunderstanding; And your claim is that Every single thing there is Exists in truth.

You are the misunderstanding That leads to the idea

That nothing can exist, Even in names.

Misunderstanding misunderstanding, Worse than misunderstanding, You are a massive entire planet Of no understanding at all.

,KHA LA KUN RDZOB KHAS BLANGS KYANG, ,KUN RDZOB RGYU RKYEN LTOS GRUB YIN, ,KHYOD NI LTOS MED GRUB PAR 'DOD, ,DES NA KUN RDZOB KHYOD LA MED,

> 251 You pay lip service To the idea That things are deceptive, But look—

If something is deceptive, Then it has its own Causes and conditions too.

You keep saying, instead, That things can exist Without relying on anything else.

What you're really saying then Is that there's no such thing As a deceptive reality.

,SPYIR DU [f. 249a] KHYOD LA 'CHI BA MED, ,KHYAD PAR KHYOD LA SKYE BA MED, ,GAL TE LHA LAS TSE 'PHOS NAS, ,LHA MA YIN DU SKYES PA'I TSE, ,LHA YI PHUNG PO LA DMIGS NAS,

,NGA'O SNYAM DU 'DZIN PA YI, ,BDEN 'DZIN DE NI MI 'GYUR BAS, ,LHA MA YIN GYI LUS DE LA, ,DMIGS NAS NGA'O SNYAM PA YI, ,BLO DE GNYIS PO GZHI GCIG TU, ,'DU BA MED KYANG 'DU BA NI, ,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I SKYON YIN MOD, ,'DU LUGS CI 'DRA BA CIG SMROS,

252

In general terms we can say That if we stick to your system, Nothing could ever die.

And more particularly, We'd have to say That nothing could ever Be born at all.

And so now suppose That a pleasure being Passes away And is born As one of their lesser cousins.

Back when they had The body and mind Of a pleasure being, They looked at those and said, "That's me!"

Now according to you, That belief in a true existence Would not have changed; And so if now they're looking At the body and mind Of the lesser cousin, And thinking now "That's me,"

You'd have two "that's me's" Coming together In a single place and time.

Of course no such thing Is possible, But the problem that it Would have to be Is a necessary consequence Of this belief of yours That things could exist in truth.

So tell me then, What's really going to happen When those two things Come together?

# The difficulties of real envy

,LHA MA YIN GYI BLO DE NI, ,LHA YI DPAL 'BYOR 'DOD YON LA, ,PHRAG DOG 'GRAN SEMS SKYES PA'I TSE, ,KHYOD RANG LHA RU SKYES PA NA, ,DPAL 'BYOR BDEN GRUB MI 'GYUR BAS, ,KHYOD DANG LHAN CIG GNAS PAR NGES, ,DES NA KHYOD KYIS KHYOD RANG LA, ,PHRAG DOG 'GRAN SEMS BYED DAM CI,

> 253 Now there within the heart Of the lesser cousins Arise different thoughts Of envy and wanting

To compete with those Higher pleasure beings In the treasures they possess, And the pleasures that they feel.

If the lesser ones die And get reborn As one of those very beings, Remember— Those treasures existed In truth, and so They wouldn't have changed; And so these beings Would still now be Possessed of all of them.

So answer me on this: What are they supposed to do? Should they be envious Of themselves? Should they each compete With themselves?

,LHA YI BDEN 'DZIN 'GYUR MED DANG, ,LHA MIN BDEN 'DZIN 'GYUR MED NA, ,KHYOD NI LHA'AM LHA MIN YIN, ,GZHI MTHUN SHES BYA LA MI SRID,

> 254 Remember — According to you, The habit of a pleasure being To see things as real Could never ever change;

And the habit of their Lesser cousin

To see things as real Could never ever change.

And don't forget— Even according to you, A single being Who was at the same time Both a pleasure being And the lower cousin Of that being Is an utter impossibility.

,LHA YI BDEN GRUB ZHIG PA'I RJES, ,LHA MIN BDEN GRUB CES ZER NA, ,SKYE 'JIG BDEN GRUB YOD MIN PAS, ,BDEN GRUB GZHAN DU 'GYUR BAS NA, ,KHYOD KYI 'GYUR MED DON DE 'GAL,

255

And suppose you say: "The way that it works Is that the true existence Of the pleasure being Comes to an end; And that is followed By the true existence Of their lesser cousin."

Well now since There could never exist A starting or a stopping That existed in truth,

And it being the case then That something that existed In truth could never change To something else,

Then you have neatly Contradicted Your own assertion That these things Could never change.

# The impossibility of a hungry ghost

,KHYOD KYI BDEN GRUB DE LTAR NA, ,'CHI 'PHO SKYE BA MI SRID KYANG, ,YI DVAGS GNAS SU SKYES PA'I TSE, ,YI DVAGS BKRES SKOM GYIS MNAR BAS, ,KHYOD KYI LHA YI DPAL 'BYOR DE, ,RTAG BRTAN THER ZUG 'GYUR MED NA, ,ZA RGYU MED TSE ZA BAR RIGS, ,LHA ZAS ZOS PAS 'GRANGS PA DE, ,'GRANGS PA GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR NA, ,DA NI CI YI PHYIR [f. 249b] NA LTOGS,

256

If things exist in truth The way you hold them to be, Then it's an impossibility That anyone could die, And move on, And then be born again.

And so if someone did get born Into the state of a hungry ghost, And that hungry ghost was being Tortured by that hunger and thirst,

Then those that had

Nothing to eat Would eat—

Since the riches they possessed As the pleasure being before Are immutable, and solid, And in and of themselves; And thus could never change.

In fact it would be the case That the full bellies they possessed In that life as a pleasure being Could never change to something other Than a belly that was full—

Why then now would they Ever feel hungry?

,YI DVAGS LUS KYI BKRES SKOM DE, ,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I 'GYUR MED NA, ,SKYE NAS SKYE BA THAMS CAD DU, ,BKRES SKOM NYID KYI RANG BZHIN LAS, ,GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA MI SRID PAS, ,'O NI RGYUN PAR BRGYAL LO AANG, ,KHYOD NI DMYAL BAR SKYES PA'I TSE, ,SKYES PA NYID KYIS BDEN GRUB 'GAL, ,DMYAL BA TSA GRANG SDUG BSNGAL DE, ,GSAR DU MYONG BAS SKYE MED 'GAL,

257

And furthermore, it being the case That things exist in truth, And thus can never change,

Then even if the hungry ghost Were feeling starved and parched, Then in all their future lives to live,

In rebirth after rebirth,

It would be an impossibility For that very hunger and thirst To change into something else, And thus waver from its nature.

They would continue their collapsing To the ground in birth after birth, And eventually find themselves Born within the hells.

This birth itself would contradict Your position that they'd been real; And it would further be a contradiction For them to have a new experience, Inside that hell, of the burning And freezing there.

,TSA BA'I SDUG BSNGAL MYONG BA'I TSE, ,LHA YI BDE SKYID GANG DU THAL, ,LHA YI SKABS KYI BDE BA DE, ,LTOS MED 'GYUR MED RAG MA LAS, ,GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA MI SRID NA, ,TSA BA'I SDUG BSNGAL CI STE MYONG,

258

And in the moment there That they began to burn, They should—according to you— Be filled with the bliss Of a pleasure being,

Since the pleasure they had As the being of pleasure before Was completely independent Of anything else at all,

And could never change, And was never conditional.

If, as you say, It were impossible for that pleasure To change into anything else, Then how could they be burned Here within the hell?

# Problems of real pleasure & pain

,BDE SDUG GNYIS PO DNGOS 'GAL NA, ,GZHI GCIG STENG DU CI STE 'DU, ,KHYOD NI LHA LAS 'PHOS MA THAG ,LHA YI BDE BA GZHAN MI 'GYUR, ,LHA YI BDE BA'I RANG BZHIN LAS, ,'GYUR BA MED CING TSA BA YI, ,SDUG BSNGAL RANG BZHIN 'GYUR MED PA, ,PHYOGS GCIG 'DU BA MI SRID KYANG, ,BDEN GRUB KHYOD LA 'DU BA NI, ,SNYING TSIM SNYING TSIM DE RE KHYER, ,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I SKYON 'DI LA, ,YON TAN DU BZUNG SNYING RE TSIM,

> 259 Pleasure and pain Are mutually exclusive things; They cannot ever happen In one person in one moment.

> And according to you, The pleasure they were feeling As a being of pleasure Could not have changed

Into something else As they moved to another Type of being.

So here you have the pleasure Of a pleasure being Which can never be altered From its natural nature;

And at the same time you have The torture of watching your body Burned within the hell— Again with a natural nature, Which cannot change Into something else.

The two could never combine Within a single person Within a single moment,

But yes I know You must hang on To your "truly exist" And claim they could combine.

I truly pity you, That you have to carry the weight Of all these contradictions;

I truly pity the fact That you feel you must consider All these different fallacies As being your badge of honor.

## ,GRANG BA'I SDUG BSNGAL MYONG BA DE, ,TSA BA'I SDUG BSNGAL RANG BZHIN DE,

,GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA'I SKABS MED PAS, ,DE DANG LHAN CIG 'GROGS BZHIN DU, ,GRANG BA'I SDUG BSNGAL RANG BZHIN DE, ,RTAG PAR SDOD PA'I THER ZUG PAS, ,SDUG BSNGAL GCIG THOG GCIG BRTZEGS PA, ,TSA GRANG GNYIS PO DNGOS 'GAL DANG, ,RANG BZHIN GNYIS PO DNGOS 'GAL NA, ,NYAMS SU JI LTAR MYONG BAR [f. 250a] 'GYUR,

260

There could never be a chance For the nature of The pain of cold to transform Into something else: Into the nature of The pain of heat.

And so in a case Where one accompanied the other, The suffering of either one Would be stacked upon itself— Since, after all, The nature of the pain of cold Would be a solid one, Staying that way forever.

And then, since the pair Of hot and cold Are incompatible— And since the two natures Would be incompatible too— How could we ever undergo The experience of either one?

,GZHI GCIG STENG DU JI LTAR 'DU, ,'GAL KHYAB THAMS CAD KHAS LEN PA'I, ,BDEN GRUB KHYOD LA SNYING RE TSIM,

## ,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I NYES PA'O,

261 How on earth could the two Ever come together In a single place or time?

It seems you will have To content yourself With this little "Really exists" of yours, And heartily embrace All the resulting contradictions Of believing in it;

For such are the faults Of anything That could have this real existence.

# Rebirth as an impossibility

,SKYE MED KHYOD NI GAL TE NA, ,MI LUS CIG NI THOB GYUR TSE, ,MI LUS GSAR DU THOB PA DANG, ,SKYE BA DNGOS SU MTHONG BZHIN DU, ,SKYE BA MED PA'I KHAS LEN MTSAR,

> 262 What we can say then Is that, in essence, You are denying That anyone could ever Take birth at all.

And yet all of us can see, With our very own eyes, How a person acquires A human form, How they come to have A new human form— How they come and take Their birth.

Even so you keep on, Continuing to insist That no one takes a birth. Your ideas are...amazing!

,MA RIG PA YI DON GCIG TSANG, ,'KHOR BA 'DI LA MTHA' MED PAS, ,'GRO BA LNGA POR SKYES PA'I TSE, ,RE RE LTAR GYI PHUNG PO LA, ,DMIGS NAS BDEN PAR GRUB PA YI, ,'DZIN STANGS SO SOR SKYES PA DANG, ,DE YANG LTOS MED 'GYUR MED DANG, ,RAG MA LAS PAR KHYOD ZHEN PA'I, ,ZHEN PA GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR BZHIN,

> 263 Where this one thing Stands complete— Where we misunderstand our world— The cycle of pain continues on, The cycle never-ending.

And in it we each are born Into each of the five different Forms of life;

And in each individual life We look upon

Each body and mind And hold them to exist in truth.

It seems as though The way you grasp to things— As depending on nothing else at all, As relying on nothing else there is— Is as well itself a belief That will have to be immutable!

,'DIR YANG PHUNG PO TSOGS TZAM LA, ,BRTEN NAS NGA'O SNYAM PA YI, ,BLO YI 'DZIN STANGS BDEN GRUB TU, ,SNANG BA LTAR DU KHYOD 'DOD PAS, ,'GRO BA DRUG PO RE RE LTAR, ,LUS KYI 'DZIN STANGS GZHI GCIG TU, ,'DU LUGS JI LTAR BYED NA AANG, ,PHAL CHER DNGOS 'GAL ZHUGS PA MANG,

264

What you believe then is that — When we look at the simple collection Of the parts that make us up, And hold it in our minds as "me" — Then this "me" exists as it seems to: As something truly there.

How then can you assert That each of these six Different kinds of birth Can exist with a single instance Of a body as you hold it to be?

Almost all of your ideas here Are simply complete contradictions. ,RNAM PA'ANG PHAL CHER GA LA MTHUN, ,'GRO BA DRUG PO THAMS CAD KYI, ,SDUG BSNGAL TSA GRANG LTAR 'GAL BA'I, ,BZOD PAR DKA' BA'I SDUG BSNGAL RNAMS, ,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I LTOS MED DANG, ,GZHAN LA RAG NI MA LAS DANG, ,'GYUR MED RTAG BRTAN THEG {%THER} ZUG 'DI, ,KHYOD KYI MI LUS 'DI THOG TU, ,DUS GCIG LA NI JI LTAR MYONG,

## 265

And how could all their features then Ever coexist?

All the unbearable sufferings Of all the six different forms That living beings take on— Sufferings that would be As contradictory in nature As feelings of hot and cold— Would be things with a real existence:

Never depending, one on another; Immutable; never-shifting; Things both concrete and solid.

How could it ever be That you experienced each of them then, Acting all together, In this one human form you have?

,KHYOD KYI LUS LA MYONG NA NI, ,BDEN GRUB 'GYUR BA MED PA 'GAL, ,[f. 250b] DNGOS 'GAL THAMS CAD GZHI MTHUN DU, ,GCIG GI THOG TU 'DU BA 'GAL,

It's a contradiction for you to claim That all your bodily experiences Are real, and that they never change.

It's a contradiction for you to claim That all these things which stand In direct contradiction to one another Could ever come together In a single common object.

## Body & mind & me

,PHUNG PO TSOGS TZAM LA BRTEN NAS, ,NGA'O SNYAM PA'I BLO DE NI, ,DMIGS PA NGA LA DMIGS NAS NI, ,RNAM PA BDEN PAR GRUB PAR 'DZIN,

267

And so here is a state of mind Which considers the simple Combination of body & mind, And thinks of it as "me."

But when it gazes upon this "me," It grasps to the perception That it is something that really exists.

# ,DE NI GANG ZAG BDAG 'DZIN YIN, ,DER ZHEN GANG ZAG BDAG ZHEN YIN, ,DE LTAR GRUB NA BDEN GRUB YIN,

268 This is what it means When we say that a person

Is grasping onto the self-existence Of the person.

This is what it means When we say that a person Is attached to the idea Of a self-existent person.

For something to exist this way Is what we mean When we say that a thing Has some true existence.

,DE 'DRA'I BLO NI LHAN SKYES LA, ,PHUNG PO LA DMIGS NGA DE NI, ,BDEN PAR GRUB PAR SNANG BA DE, ,SNANG BA LTAR DU GRUB 'DUG NA, ,RTAG PA MTHA' BZUNG TSUL GYIS SU, ,DGAG BYA'I TSAD KYI DGAG RGYU DE, ,'KHRUL MED NGOS NI ZIN PA NA, ,DE NI DGAG RGYU'I GTZO BO YIN, ,DGRA YI GTZO BO'ANG DE YIN NO,

> 269 And now suppose it were the case That the "me" we see When an inborn state of mind like this Gazes upon the body & mind And thinks they exist in truth Really did exist in truth.

That thing then— This thing that could only exist In a theoretical sense— Is the thing we need to deny: This is the measure Of what we need to refuse. If we can identify, Without any error, This supposed thing, Then that itself is the main thing Which we must seek to deny.

And it is as well The face of our true foe.

## ,DA DUNG KHYOD LA 'GAL 'DU YI, ,PHUNG PO CHEN PO 'DI LTAR RO,

270 And yet still you cling To this mighty mountain Of your own contradictions!

# A "me" independent of my body & my mind

,DE LTAR GYUR PA'I NGA DE NI, ,PHUNG PO DANG NI RANG NGOS NAS, ,GRUB PA'I GCIG TU GRUB PA'AM, ,GRUB PA'I THA DAD GANG DU GRUB,

271And let me ask you a question:Is this "me" that you believe inSomething that exists, from its own side,As one and the sameAs body & mind?Or somehow separate from it?

## ,GCIG TU GRUB PO ZER NA NI, ,THA DAD GTAN MED GCIG GRUB DANG, ,RANG BZHIN GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR DANG, ,GZHAN LA RAG NI MA LAS DANG, ,LTOS MED 'GYUR MED THER ZUG PAS,

272 Ah! You say this me Is the same as that body & mind?

Then they must be A one & the same Which can never allow For any degree of separation;

They must be a single thing; And its nature must never vary, Even the slightest bit; And it must never rely On anything other;

It must be solid, Ever self-standing, Ever immutable.

,SHI NAS PHUNG PO MER BSREGS SHING, ,THAL BA CHU KLUNG BSKUR BA'I TSE, ,PHUNG PO GTAN MED GYUR PAS NA, ,NGA YANG GTAN MED GYUR TAM CI,

## 273

Is what you're saying then Is that when this person dies, And their body is burned in the fire, And their ashes thrown Into the waters of some river,

And the body & mind Are gone forever, Then the "me" forever Disappears as well?

## ,PHUNG PO DANG NI RANG NGOS NAS, ,GRUB PA'I 'GYUR BA GANG DU SONG, ,'GYUR BA 'GYUR BA'I 'GYUR MED MTSAR,

274

Where then is it That the body & mind, And the change that they Have passed through— Coming as it does, From its very own side— Have all gone off to?

This changeless Change of changing of yours Is truly a wondrous thing!

# Problems with the idea of aging & dying

,PHUNG PO 'DI DANG LHAN CIG TU, ,'GYUR MED RTAG PAR BDEN GRUB NA, ,SHI BA'I THA SNYAD GA LA BYED, ,'CHI BA MED NA SKYE BA MED, ,RGA DANG NA SOGS [f. 251a] GA NA MCHIS,

> 275 If this "me" is something That exists in truth,

Forever unchanging, Part & parcel With body & mind, Then how on earth Could you even talk of it As something that could die?

And if somebody never dies, Then neither were they ever born— And how then could we say That they suffered growing old, And illness and all the rest?

,YANG GCIG CHOS KUN MED PA KHYOD, ,SKYE 'CHI YOD NA BDEN GRUB MED, ,KHYOD KYI LUGS LA CHOS KUN NI, ,STOS {%LTOS} MED 'GYUR BA MED PAR GRUB, ,PHAN TSUN LTOS GRUB CHOS MED PAS, ,DES NA KHYOD LA CHOS KUN MED,

276

And if this one-and-the-same me That was none of everything there is Could be born, and could then die, Then it wouldn't any more exist As that kind of real That you were talking about!

According to your system, Every single thing in the universe Exists in a way where it need not depend On anything else in the universe— In a way where it never changes.

According to you, there cannot exist Any objects which stand In dependence upon each other;

And so what you're really saying Is that there cannot exist Any objects at all in the universe!

## ,GZHAN DU 'GYUR LA MI 'GYUR ZER, ,KHYOD NI MA RIG RANG DU 'DUG ,DE YI NANG NAS RANG MA RIG

277

When you make your claim That things which change Into other things never do,

It shows that you have really Gone and made your home In a state of misunderstanding;

And even within that house You tend to stay in the room Called "misunderstanding myself."

# Problems of conversing with stones

,KHYOD NI 'GRO BA GZHAN SKYES TSE, ,DE YI PHUNG DANG NGA GNYIS NI, ,BDEN PA'I GCIG TU GRUB DGOS PAS, ,PHUNG PO 'DI LA DMIGS NAS NI, ,'GRO BA GZHAN GYI PHUNG PO LA'ANG, ,NGA'O SNYAM PA'I BLO SKYE DGOS,

> 278 When the time comes for you

To take your birth into a different life, Then your "me" and the body & mind That exist there in that new life Are going to have to exist As a single thing that is also real.

And then even when you sit and look At this body & mind that belong To another world, another form of life, It's going to have to pop into Your thoughts: "Oh, that is me!"

,DES NA 'GRO GZHAN PHUNG PO DE, ,PHUNG PO 'DI THOG YOD DGOS PAS, ,MED KYANG LHAN CIG TSOGS PA 'DI, ,DNGOS 'GAL BYUNG YANG MA RIG PA, ,KHYOD DANG LHAN CIG RTZOD PA 'DI, ,SMYON PA NGAG {%or DAG? check another carving} DANG RTZOD PA 'DRA,

279

And then it's going to have To be the case That this body & mind In a different world Exists stacked on top Of the body & mind That you possess now.

And then you'll experience A great new contradiction, Where things that can't exist In the first place are suddenly Stacked upon each other.

Mr. Misunderstanding, I have to say That having a debate with you

Is something like discussing the truth With a person who's gone mad!

# ,LABS PA LA NI KHYAD MED PAS, ,YANG NA RDO DANG RTZOD PA 'DRA, ,KHYOD NI RDO LAS CHES LOD PA, ,RDO LA BZO BCOS CI BYAS NYAN,

280 Since talking to you Doesn't seem To make any difference at all,

We could also say That debating with you Is like arguing with a stone;

Except that the quality Of your thinking Is infinitely worse Than that of a stone.

What adjustment Could one ever make To a stone to help it Listen better?

# And how does death work, anyway?

,CI MI NYAN PA'I MA RIG PA, ,SHI BA KHYOD LA YOD MA YIN, ,GAL TE SHI NAS GZHAN SKYES TSE, ,GAL TE SKYES TSE KHYOD PHUNG DANG,

## ,'BRAL MED BDEN PAR GNAS DGOS DANG, ,SPYIR DU 'CHIB {%'CHI BA} GA LA BYED,

281

The fact of death, According to you— Sir Misunderstanding, Who cannot listen to anything— Could not in fact exist.

If once you had died You were born as something else; And if when you were born As that something else, You had to live on As something that was real, And indivisible from Your body & mind;

Then how could we ever speak, Even in general terms, Of the fact of death itself?

# ,SGOS SU PHUNG PO 'DI KHYER NAS, ,GZHAN GYI MA YI MNGAL DU NI, ,BDEN PAR SKYE LUGS JI LTAR BYED, ,PHUNG PO 'DI BCAS ZHUGS SAM CI,

282

If you take your own Personal body & mind And carry it with you Into the womb Of someone else's mother,

And thus take a birth In a way that is real,

Just how does that work?

Have you gone in there With this very same Body & mind?

## ,DE BZHIN ZHUGS PAR GYUR ZER KYANG, ,ZHUGS PA'I 'GYUR BA KHO NAS NI, ,BDEN GRUB 'GYUR BA MED PA 'GAL,

283

And suppose you claim That this exactly the way That you have entered there;

Isn't it though the case That the change involved In having entered Contradicts your position Of immutable self-existence?

## ,PHUNG PO BZHAG NAS [f. 251b] SKYE NA NI, ,SKYE BA KHO NAS BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

284 And even if what really happens Is that you leave behind This body & mind And go and take your birth,

That very fact of being born Already contradicts This idea of real existence.

# Moving on from "me" to "mine"

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG GRUB NA, ,NGA YI BA LA DMIGS PA YI, ,NGA YIR 'DZIN PA KHYOD LA MED,

> 285 If "me" is something that is Really one and the same With the body and the mind,

Then according to you It would never be possible To hold to something as "mine" In the sense of focusing On those things that are mine.

,GAL TE NGA YIR 'DZIN ZHE NA, ,BDEN GRUB GZHAN DU 'GYUR BAS NA, ,'GYUR BA MED PA'I BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

> 286 And if you say That it really *is* possible To hold to something as "mine,"

Then a thing that exists as real Has changed into something else— Thus contradicting your idea Of a self-existent existence Impossible to change.

## ,NGA YI LAG PA LA DMIGS PA'I, ,NGA YI BA YI BDEN GRUB DE,

## ,'GYUR BA MED PA'I RTAG PAR DANG, ,LTOS MED GZHAN LA RAG MA LAS,

287

The real existence of a mine Where you focus on *my* hand Would have to be unchanging; Something that never varied, Never depending, never relying On anything else at all.

# ,NGO BOS GRUB PA'I 'GYUR MED DANG, ,NGA YI RKANG SOGS LA DMIGS PA'I, ,NGA YIR 'DZIN PA SKYE BA 'GAL,

288 A changelessness That existed in and of itself Would contradict the very idea Of a perception starting up That was focused upon *my* leg, Or anything else of the like.

# Problems with the shifts in attraction

,GAL TE BLO NI SKYES PA NA, ,BDEN PA GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA DANG, ,SKYE BA KHO NAS 'GYUR MED 'GAL, ,BDEN PAS TSUGS NI MA THUB PO,

289

As soon as we get a single thought, Then reality undergoes a change;

This and the simple fact of starting Contradict the idea of changelessness.

Something that was really real Could never stand on its own.

# ,DE BZHIN CHAGS PA'I BDEN GRUB DE, ,GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR THER ZUG PAS, ,'DI MIN KUN LA 'GROS 'DI KHYER,

290

So too, a real reality In the form of feeling attachment Would be something that was solid, And never open to change.

You should think about The effect this would have On the idea that everyone Likes to talk about: "Freedom from attachment."

,BUD MED LTA BU LA DMIGS NAS, ,MIG GIS GZUGS LA CHAGS PA YI, ,YID 'ONG DNGOS PO GZHAN DAG LA, ,BDEN PA'I CHAGS PA SKYE BA 'GAL, ,GAL TE SKYE NA 'GYUR MED 'GAL, ,SKYE BA KHO NAS BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

291

It would be a contradiction then To say that a man had looked At something like a woman And felt attraction to her form,

And then begun to feel as well

An attraction that was real Towards any other Alluring object at all;

If the attraction began to be felt, Then that would contradict The idea that it was real;

If something even begins at all, Then that contradicts The idea that things are immutable;

And so we can say That it takes no more Than something starting To contradict your idea That things could exist as real.

,DE BZHIN DBANG PO GZHAN DAG LA'ANG, ,SO SOR CHAGS YUL LA DMIGS PA'I, ,BDEN PA'I CHAGS PA SKYE BA 'GAL, ,GAL TE SKYE NA SKYE MED 'GAL, ,BDEN GRUB GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA'ANG 'GAL,

> 292 The same reasoning applies To a case where any other Organ of the sense might focus On an object of attraction:

It would be a contradiction To say that the attraction was real.

And if the attraction started up, Then that would contradict the idea That nothing could ever start:

It would be a contradiction even if A thing that really existed Could change to something else.

,DANG PO THOG MA MED DUS NAS, ,MIG GI DBANG PO'I YUL DAG LA, ,BDEN PA'I CHAGS PA LTOS MED DU, ,GRUB GRUB PAR NI YOD ZER NA,

293

And suppose you say That it's the case That from the very beginning, From the very start of things,

There have always been Feelings of attraction To the objects of The sense power of the eye That were real;

That since forever these feelings Have always existed, Without depending on anything else.

## **Problems with kids & fogeys**

,'O NA PHUNG PO 'DI YANG NI, ,DANG PO THOG MA MED DUS NAS, ,LTOS [f. 252a] MED GRUB PAR YOD DAM CI,

> 294 Well then, are you saying That this particular body & mind

Has also existed— Since the very first days, For time with no beginning, Independent of anything else?

# ,YOD NA 'GRO BA GZHAN LNGA RU, ,SKYE BA MED PAS KHYOD LA 'GAL, ,MI LUS TSE 'DIR 'PHRAL BLANGS BZHIN, ,THOG MED GRUB PA'I KHAS LEN 'GAL,

295

And if so, then since There should never have been Any births into any of the other Of the five different forms of life, You contradict yourself.

You contradict the fact That for time without beginning We have taken on these births,

In just the same way That in this present moment We have slipped on a human body Here within this life.

,BU CHUNG NAS NI RIM PAR NI, ,RGAN PO'I LUS SU GYUR BZHIN DU, ,THOG MED DUS NAS RGAN PO'I LUS, ,'DI GA BCOS MIN LTOS MED DU, ,GRUB PA'I KHAS LEN 'DI 'DRA AANG, ,MA RIG YIN KYANG GAD MO 'CHOR,

> 296 Our bodies transform, Step by step,

From the form of a child Into that of the aged.

How then can you Take the position That this same body Of the elderly one Has existed for time Without a beginning, Never refreshed, Existing in and of itself?

Yes, we know— It's just your misunderstanding, But how can we keep A burst of laughter From escaping out our lips?

,AA MAR SKYES PA YIN BZHIN DU, ,'GYUR MED RGAN PO'I RANG BZHIN DU, ,GRUB GRUB 'DRA BA 'DI GAR NA, ,RGAN POR AA MA'I LUS SU NI, ,ZHUGS PA'I TSUL 'DI KHYOD KYIS SMROS,

> 297 On one hand then You have somebody Taking birth inside their mother;

Who on the other hand Keeps going on In the form of a fogey unchanged.

Tell us now Just how this works: Someone here who's elderly, And who's entered into

The body of their mother!

# A list of different "mines"

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG GRUB NA, ,PHUNG PO LA CHAGS BDEN 'DZIN DE, ,'GYUR BA MED PAS SEMS LA NI, ,BDEN 'DZIN CI YI PHYIR NA SKYE,

298

If the "me" really is One and the same With my body and mind In a way which is real,

Then our habit of grasping To some true existence Of our body and our mind Would have to be unchangeable.

How then could we ever begin To have in our mind fresh ideas Of holding things as true?

,SKYE NA GZHAN 'GYUR MED PA 'GAL, ,SKYE BA MED PA'I DON DANG 'GAL, ,KUN LA 'DI YI RIGS BSGRES NA, ,'DI 'DRA'I RIGS LA ZAD MTHA' MED,

> 299 If those ideas did begin, Then that would contradict Your idea that nothing could ever Change into something else.

It would contradict Your idea That none of these would start.

And since this same logic applies Equally to every other thing there is, The things that are really endless Are the applications of these thoughts.

,NGA DANG PHUNG PO BDEN PA YI, ,THA DAD DU NI GRUB PA NA, ,'BREL MED DON GZHAN YIN DGOS PAS, ,LAG PA NA YANG NGA NA ZHES, ,BDAG GIR BYED PA 'BREL MED YIN,

> 300 And now suppose instead That the "me" existed as something Which was separate, in truth, From the body and the mind.

In this case, this "me" And body & mind would have to be Completely unrelated, separate things.

And then it would be Completely irrelevant To consider anything as my own: To say, when I hurt my hand, That I had hurt myself.

,NGA YI MGO DANG NGA YI KHA, ,NGA YI SNA RTZE MIG DBANG SOGS, ,NGA YI LUS DANG NGA YI GROD, ,NGA YI RKED TSIGS PUS MO DANG,

,NGA YI LTO SKOM GOS LA SOGS, ,NGA YI ZHING KHANG NGA YI GA-YOG ,NGA YI CHUNG MA BU SOGS DANG, ,NGA YI DNGOS PO THAMS CAD LA, ,DMIGS NAS NGA YIR 'DZIN PA YI, ,BLO NI SKYE BA [f. 252b] 'BREL MED YIN,

> 301 So too would it become Completely irrelevant To ever begin to feel a thought Where we considered a thing And held it to be mine;

For none of them would ever be My head, my mouth, The tip of my nose, The senses of my eyes, My whole body, or my belly, Or my spine, or knees, The hunger in my stomach, The clothes upon my back;

My fields, my house, The ones who work for me;

My wife, my children, My anything else — Each and every thing of mine.

# ,BDEN PA'I 'BREL MED DON GZHAN LA, ,'BREL BA GTAN MED AA THANG CHAD, ,BDEN 'DZIN DANG NI SHES RAB BZHIN, ,LHAN CIG GNAS PA'I SKABS MED PAS,

302 And don't keep telling me

That if a connection isn't real, Then there's no connection at all— You wear my patience thin!

According to you, It would have to be meaningless For us ever to look at a thing That was mine, and think That it was mine,

Since me and the thing— Like the habit of grasping To things as real, and Wisdom herself— Could never live together Within a single place.

,NGA YI BA LA DMIGS PA YI, ,NGA YIR 'DZIN PA'I DON MED PAS, ,NGA YI BA LA BDAG GIR NI, ,BYED PA MA RIG KHYOD LA 'GAL, ,'GAL YANG BYED NA RGYU MTSAN MED, ,DE BAS KHA ROG 'DUG NA DGA',

> 303 Since there's no point In looking at the things that are mine And considering them to be mine,

It's a contradiction, Mr. Misunderstanding, For you to claim the things That are "mine" for you As being yours.

And there's not much point To keep on doing the same thing Where it's a blatant contradiction.

I think maybe You should take a break, And sit still for a bit.

## ,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I DU MAR NI, ,GRUB NA NGA PHUNG BDEN PA YI, ,GCIG TU GRUB PAR 'GYUR BA YIN,

304

If what I consider "me" Is, in truth, the many parts Of my body & mind, Then my "me" must also be A single thing with body & mind.

## Some scripture in support

,RGYU MTSAN RIN CHEN PHRENG BA LAS, ,GCIG MED PHYIR NA DU MA DANG, ,ZHES DANG GZHAN YANG DU MA NI, ,YOD NA GCIG KYANG YOD DGOS SO,

> 304 The reason for this Can be found In the *String of Precious Jewels,* Where it speaks of things Not being more than one, Since they are not one.

And in any case, If there could ever be more than one, There would have to be A one as well.

# ,NGA DANG PHUNG PO GCIG PAR THAL, ,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG YIN PHYIR, ,'DOD NA DBU MA 'JUG PAR BKAG

305 And isn't it the case That the "me" and my body & mind Are one and the same? Because the "me" and my body & mind Are a one and the same that's real.

Oh you may agree to it; But *Entering the Middle Way* Proves that idea wrong.

# Problems with splitting the me's and mine's

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG GRUB NA, ,PHUNG PO'I CHA SHAS KUN DANG NI, ,BDEN PA'I GCIG TU GRUB DGOS PAS, ,SHAR NUB LHO BYANG DBUS DBYE BA'I, ,PHYOGS NI GANG DU GCIG PAR 'GYUR,

> 306 If the "me" were, In reality, One with my body & mind,

Then the "me" would have to be, In reality, One with each and every one

Of the separate parts of body & mind.

And then the "me" would be One with each of the separate Directions of east, and west, South, and north, and middle.

## ,DBUS CHAR MTSON NAS GCIG NA NI, ,DE LA'ANG SHAR NUB DBUS DBYE'O,

307

And then the same with, For example, The parts of the middle itself; For it too can be divided Into its own east & west & middle.

,DE BZHIN THA MAR RDUL PHRAN NI, ,LCAGS RDUL TZAM DU GSIL BA'I TSE, ,RDUL MED MA GYUR BAR DU NI, ,GSIL BA'I TSE NA BDEN 'DZIN KHYOD, ,BDEN PA'I GCIG TU SU DANG 'GROGS,

> 308 And it would be the same As well all the way down To the tiny atoms of stuff:

Suppose you reduced things Down to iron particles, And then all the way past that To the point where There would no longer be Any particle at all.

What real single one is it then,

My Friend Who Grasps to Real, That you relate yourself to When things are reduced to that?

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I RANG BZHIN DU, ,'GYUR BA MED PA GANG DU SONG, ,'GYUR GYIN 'GYUR GYIN MI 'GYUR ZER, ,'DI 'DRA'I BDEN GRUB YA MTSAN CAN,,

> 309 Where then would your "me" Run off to—the one That was unchangeable, And truly in nature body & mind?

Oh this real existence of yours— The kind that's always changing, And then changing over again— But which still you say is changeless, Is truly something amazing!

# Mr. Misunderstanding defends himself

"BDEN 'DZIN GYIS [f. 253a] NI LAN SMRAS PA,

310 And then the Habit of Seeing Things as Real replied—