

Stepping into Our Next World

*Session 15 of “The Angel Debates the Devil”
Spring 2022*

走進我們的下一個世界

第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》
2022 年春季

*We continue with our study of the epic poem entitled “The Angel Debates the Devil,”
written by His Holiness the First Panchen Lama, Lobsang Chukyi Gyeltsen, some
400 years ago—*

我們繼續學習史詩《天使與魔鬼之辯》，這首詩是由一世班禪喇嘛洛桑·曲
吉·堅贊在大約400 年前寫的。

How can a pleasure being die?

天人（沉溺享受的人）怎麼會死呢？

,LHA YI TSE DANG DPAL 'BYOR SOGS,
, 'DOD YON BDEN PAR GRUB SNANG BA,
,DE NI THOG MA MED PA NAS,
,KHO RANG LTOS MED GRUB GRUB PA,
, 'GYUR MED RTAG PAR SDOD PAS NA,
,CHI DANG TSE 'PHO GA LA SRID,

And The Angel continued:
天使接著說：

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

The lifetime of the pleasure being —
And all their glory,
And all their possessions,
All the objects of their senses —
Would appear to exist
In reality.

天人的一生——
以及他們所有的榮耀、
所有的財產、
所有的感官物件
看起來都存在於
現實之中。

Those then for time
With no beginning
Would have to have existed
Without depending
On a single other thing.
那些在無始劫裡的
其存在
必須
不依賴於
任何其他事物。

And that would make them
Things that could never change;
Things that remained there
Forever the same.
這將使他們成為
永遠不會改變的
事物；
那些保持永遠不變的事物。

How then could it be possible
For this person to ever die,
Or move on to another life?
那麼這個人
怎麼可能會死，

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

或者進入另一世呢？

, 'CHI DANG TSE 'PHO SRID ZER NA,
, RANG TSUGS THUB PAR MA GYUR PAS,
, 'GYUR BA MED PA'I BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

242

And suppose you insist:

"Yet it is a fact

That people do die,

And move on to

Another birth."

假如你堅持說：

「但這是事實

人的確會死，

然後去投生。」

Well since in that case

They would no longer be

Things that stand on their own,

It would become a contradiction

To continue to insist

That they existed "in reality,"

In a nature immutable.

既然那樣的話，

他們就不再是

獨立存在的事物了，

那麼堅持說

他們存在於「現實中」，

存在於一種永恆的自然中，

就變得矛盾了。

How can our senses be replaced?

我們的感官如何被取代？

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,LHA LUS BDEN PAR GRUB PA NA,
, 'GRO BA GZHAN DU SKYE BA' ANG MED,
, 'DOD PA' I YON TAN LGA PO YANG,
,LHA MO' I GZUGS LA CHAGS PA YI,
,CHAGS PA BDEN PAR SNANG BA YI,
,SNANG BA GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR BAS,
,SGRA SOGS 'DOD YON BZHI PO LA,
,CHAGS PA CI YI PHYIR NA SKYE,
,SKYE NA GZUGS LA BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

243

If the body of a pleasure being
Really did exist in truth,
Then they could never take
A rebirth as another
Type of being.
如果天人的肉身
確實真的存在，
那麼他們永遠不可能
以另一種生命形式
再次投生。

And the five objects
Of the senses—
Appearing as they do
To the attachment to
Their heavenly form
As if they existed in truth—
Could never start appearing
To be some other way.
而感官
的五種對象——
看起來就像
它們依附於
它們的天界的形式那樣，
仿佛真的存在——
那麼就永遠不會
以其他方式出現。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

In that case then
How could anyone
Begin to feel attachment
To the other four objects
Of the senses—
Sound and all the rest?
那麼，
怎麼能有人
開始感到對其他四種感官——
聲音
和其他所有感官——
的依附呢？

If they did, then it
Would clearly be a contradiction
For the colors and shapes
They'd already been focusing on
To have existed in reality.
如果他們這麼做了，
那麼這顯然就是一個矛盾
因為他們一直關注的
將要有的顏色和形狀
在現實中存在過。

**How could we love
our loved ones?**
我們如何愛
我們所愛的人？

,LHA YI BU MO LA DMIGS NAS,
,YID DU 'ONG BA'I BYAMS PA DE,
,LTOS MED BDEN PAR GRUB PAR SNANG,
,SNANG BA GZHAN 'GYUR MI SRID NA,
,LHA MA YIN DANG 'THAB PA'I TSE,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,ZHE SDANG SKYE BA DNGOS SU 'GAL,
,GAL TE ZHE SDANG SKYES PA NA,
,YID 'ONG BYAMS PA'I BDEN GRUB DE,
,LTOS MED 'GYUR BA MED PA 'GAL,

244

And when the beings of pleasure
Gazed upon their daughters
With that version of love
That sees them as so lovely,
That love would see
What it sees in a way
That depended on nothing else,
As something truly there.

而當天人
用那種愛的眼光
注視著自己的女兒
把她們看得那麼可愛，
那種愛
以一種不依賴於任何其他事物的方式
而真的存在。

That way of things appearing
Is something that could never
Change to looking another way;
事物出現的方式
永遠不會改變
換成另外一種方式呈現；

And that would directly contradict
The fact that—when these beings
Of pleasure battle with their cousins—
Their feelings change to hatred.
這將直接與一個事實相矛盾，
即當這些天人
與他們的表親戰鬥時，
他們的感情會變成仇恨。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

If these pleasure beings
Could begin to feel hate,
Then that would contradict
The idea that their lovely love
Existed in reality,
And depended on nothing else.
如果這些天人
開始感到仇恨，
那麼，這就與他們的愛
是真實存在、
而不依賴其他任何事物的觀點
相矛盾了。

**How could we hate
our enemies?**
我們怎麼能憎恨
敵人呢？

,LHA MA YIN LA DMIGS PA YI,
,ZHE SDANG DRAG PO SKYES PA'I TSE,
,ZHE SDANG BDEN PAR SNANG BAS NA,
, 'THAB MO GROL NAS RANG YUL DU,
,LHA MO LA NI BRTZE BA'I TSE,
,YID 'ONG RNAM PA SKYE BA MED,
,SKYE NA ZHE SDANG BDEN GRUB 'GAL,
,YID 'ONG DE YANG GSAR SKYE BAS,
,YID 'ONG BDEN [f. 248b] PAR GRUB PA 'GAL,

245
And yet when these beings
Do look upon their cousins—
The "almost pleasure beings"—
And start to feel intense
Feelings of hatred for them,
That hatred itself

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Begins to look as if
It too existed in reality.
然而，當這些天人
看待他們的表親——
「近乎天人（非天）」——
並開始對他們產生強烈的
仇恨情緒時，
這種仇恨本身
似乎也開始存在於
現實之中。

When the wars then come
To an end,
And the pleasure beings return
To their own lands,
And the time too returns
For them to look upon
Those divine daughters
With thoughts of love
That see them again as lovely,
Well that would contradict
The idea that their former hatred
Had existed in reality.
當戰爭結束，
天人回到
自己的土地，
他們也會帶著
愛的念頭
來看待
那些神聖的女兒，
又把她們看做可愛的人
的時光又回來了，
這與他們之前的
仇恨在現實中存在
的觀點相矛盾。

And moreover,
If this perception

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Of their daughters as lovable
Could start afresh in their hearts,
Then that in turn
Would contradict the idea
That the lovely love itself
Existed in truth.

而且，
如果這種對女兒可愛的感知
會在他們心中重新啟動，
那麼，
這反過來又
與可愛的愛本身
真的存在
的觀點相矛盾。

**If things are real,
they could never exist**
如果事物是真的，
它們就不可能存在

,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I LAG STABS 'DIS,
,CHOS RNAMS THAMS CAD MED PA 'DRA,
,BLO GCIG BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I NGOR,
,CHOS KUN SKYE 'GAG 'GRO 'ONG MED,
,THA SNYAD LAS 'BRAS THAMS CAD MED,

246
This method of implementing
The concept that things
Could exist in reality
Is the same for every other
Thing in the universe:
They simply
Could never exist!
實施

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

事物會存在於現實中
的概念的方法
對於宇宙中的其他事物
都是一樣的：
他們根本不可能存在！

If a single state of our mind
Existed in and of itself,
Then none of the things
In the whole universe
That ever appeared to it
Could ever start, or stop,
Or go, or come.
如果我們的意識
僅有的一種狀態，
存在於它自身
那麼
整個宇宙中
沒有任何曾呈現於它面前的事物
可以開始，停止，
或來去。

Nor could karma
And its consequences
Even exist,
Even in name.
業與果
也都無法存在，
即使在名義上。

,MDOR NA CHOS KUN MED PAR GO
,DE YI RGYU MTSAN CI STE NA,
,BDEN PAR 'DOD RNAMS CHOS KUN NI,
,LTOS MED GZHAN LA RAG MA LAS,
,KHO RANG NGO BOS GRUB PAR SNANG,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

To put it briefly,
Please understand,
Everything that exists
Would cease to exist.
簡而言之，
請理解，
一切存在的事物
都將不復存在。

And why is that?
為何如此？

Once you say
That a thing exists in truth,
Then it cannot rely
Upon any other thing;
It could never
Be relative
To anything else.
一旦你說
事物是真實存在的，
那麼它就不依賴於
任何其他事物；
它永遠不會
與其他任何事物
相關。

It would have to appear
In the universe
All on its own, in itself.
它必須在宇宙中
以自性出現，
獨立存在。

,JIG RTEN THA SNYAD LA BSTUN PA'I,
,CHOS RNAMS THAMS CAD RGYU RKYEN DANG,
,PHAN TSUN LTOS BZHAG BLO BUR DU,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,RTOG PA'AM MING GIS BTAGS TZAM LA,
,GZHI GCIG STENG DU GNYIS KA NI,
, 'DU BA'I SKABS CIG MA BYUNG BAS,
,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I PHYOGS LTAR NA,
,RKYEN LA LTOS PA'I CHOS KUN MED,
,DES NA CHOS KUN MED PA YIN,

248

Consider now
These two ideas—
現在考慮
這兩個想法——

One, that things in the universe
Generally match the way
That they are spoken about
In terms of the world at large:
一，宇宙中的事物
一般來說，
與他們在整個世界中
被談論的方式普遍相匹配：

They rely on their causes,
And they rely on comparison
One to the other.
他們依賴於自己的原因，
他們依賴於
一個對另一個的比較。

Two, that they spring up
All of a sudden;
Products of nothing more
Than mental pictures,
And names.
二，它們突然出現；
只不過是
意識圖片以及名字
的產物。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

These two ideas
Could never convene
And cooperate
With regard to any
Single object in the world.
這兩個想法
永遠不能匯合
並與世界上任何一個物體
合作。

If thinking thus we approach
The position that things
Exist with some reality
Of their own,
如果這樣想，
我們趨於認為
事物以自身的某種現實
存在，

We would have to assert
That there was no single thing
In this entire universe
That depended on conditions.
我們必須斷言，
整個宇宙中，
沒有一件事物
依賴於條件。

And then we'd have
To go further,
And say that nothing
Existed at all.
我們還必須
更進一步說，
根本就不存在任何事物。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

**How things
really are real**
事物怎麼就真是真的

,NGA YI PHYOGS LA CHOS KUN NI,
,RGYU RKYEN RTEN 'BREL TSOGS LAS SKYE,
,DES NA CHOS KUN YOD PA YIN,
,LAS DANG 'BRAS BU MYONG BA YOD,
,SA DANG LAM DANG DKON MCHOG GSUM,
,THA SNYAD THAMS CAD BDAG LA YOD,
,DE YANG THA SNYAD TZAM DU YIN,
,BDEN PA'I DON DU KHYOD DANG 'DRA,
,CHOS KUN GTAN NAS MED PAR 'DOD,

249

Now my own position
On all of this
Is that everything there is
Comes from the cooperation
Of causes and conditions,
And things depending
On other things.
現在對於所有這些
我個人的觀點是
所有事物都來自於
原因和條件的結合，
一件事物
導致另一件事物。

Then we can say
That everything there is, is.
那麼我們可以說
所有存在的，都存在。

Karma and its consequences
Are something we actually experience;

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

And if you stick with me,
You can keep your ideas
Of spiritual levels, and spiritual paths,
And all three of the Jewels—
In my camp, all of them
Are there, in their names.
業力與其結果都是我們實際經歷的事情;
如果你堅持聽我的話,
你可以繼續保持
你對精神境界和精神道路的看法,
所有的三寶——
在我的營地,所有都在那裡,
以他們的名義。

But they are *only* there
In names;
If we take the expression
"Existing in reality"
The way you want us to,
但他們只是
名義上的;
如果我們按照
你想要的方式表達
「在現實中存在」

Then nothing in the universe
Could ever exist at all.
那麼宇宙中任何事物
都不可能存在。

,KHYOD NI GTI MUG MA RIG PAS,
,CHOS KUN BDEN PAR KHAS BLANGS PAS,
,THA SNYAD DU YANG CHOS KUN NI,
,MED PAR SONG BA MA RIG PA,
,MA RIG LAS NI MA RIG PA,
,MA RIG DKYIL 'KHOR CHEN PO'O,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

250

You are darkness,
You are misunderstanding;
And your claim is that
Every single thing there is
Exists in truth.

你是黑暗，
你是誤解；
你的主張是
每一件存在的事物
都真實存在。

You are the misunderstanding
That leads to the idea
That nothing can exist,
Even in names.

你就是誤解，
引出了這個觀點：
一切都不可能存在，
即使只是名義上的存在。

Misunderstanding misunderstanding,
Worse than misunderstanding,
You are a massive entire planet
Of no understanding at all.

誤解誤解，
比誤解本身更糟糕，
你（們）是一個巨大的、
完全沒有理解的星球。

,KHA LA KUN RDZOB KHAS BLANGS KYANG,
,KUN RDZOB RGYU RKYEN LTOS GRUB YIN,
,KHYOD NI LTOS MED GRUB PAR 'DOD,
,DES NA KUN RDZOB KHYOD LA MED,

251

You pay lip service

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

To the idea
That things are deceptive,
But look—
你口頭上
贊同這個理念：
事物具有欺騙性，
但看起來——

If something is deceptive,
Then it has its own
Causes and conditions too.
如果某事物具有欺騙性，
那麼它也有自己的
原因和條件。

You keep saying, instead,
That things can exist
Without relying on anything else.
相反，你一直在說，
事物可以不依賴
其他任何東西而存在。

What you're really saying then
Is that there's no such thing
As a deceptive reality.
那你真正想說的是
不存在欺騙性的現實
這回事。

,SPYIR DU [f. 249a] KHYOD LA 'CHI BA MED,
,KHYAD PAR KHYOD LA SKYE BA MED,
,GAL TE LHA LAS TSE 'PHOS NAS,
,LHA MA YIN DU SKYES PA'I TSE,
,LHA YI PHUNG PO LA DMIGS NAS,
,NGA'O SNYAM DU 'DZIN PA YI,
,BDEN 'DZIN DE NI MI 'GYUR BAS,
,LHA MA YIN GYI LUS DE LA,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,DMIGS NAS NGA'O SNYAM PA YI,
,BLO DE GNYIS PO GZHI GCIG TU,
, 'DU BA MED KYANG 'DU BA NI,
,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I SKYON YIN MOD,
, 'DU LUGS CI 'DRA BA CIG SMROS,

252

In general terms we can say
That if we stick to your system,
Nothing could ever die.
一般來說，我們可以說，
如果我們堅持你的體統，
沒有什麼會死亡。

And more particularly,
We'd have to say
That nothing could ever
Be born at all.
更具體地，
我們不得不說，
根本沒有什麼東西
會誕生。

And so now suppose
That a pleasure being
Passes away
And is born
As one of their lesser cousins.
所以現在假設
一位天人
過世了，
然後以比他低級的表親的形式
投生了。

Back when they had
The body and mind
Of a pleasure being,
They looked at those and said,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of *"The Angel Debates the Devil"*
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

"That's me!"

回溯到當他們擁有
天人的
身體和意識時，
他們看著這些，然後說，
「那是我！」

Now according to you,
That belief in a true existence
Would not have changed;
And so if now they're looking
At the body and mind
Of the lesser cousin,
And thinking now "That's me,"
現在根據你的說法，
相信真實存在的想法
不會改變；
所以如果他們現在看的是
更低級表親的身體和意識，
現在想著「這就是我」，

You'd have two "that's me's"
Coming together
In a single place and time.
你會有兩個「這就是我」
在同一個地方和時間
出現在一起。

Of course no such thing
Is possible,
But the problem that it
Would have to be
Is a necessary consequence
Of this belief of yours
That things could exist in truth.
當然這種事
是不可能的，
但不可回避的問題是，

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

你相信事物可以真實存在的
想法
的必然結果。

So tell me then,
What's really going to happen
When those two things
Come together?
那麼告訴我，
當這兩件事
來到一起時，
會發生什麼？

**The difficulties
of real envy**
真正嫉妒的困境

,LHA MA YIN GYI BLO DE NI,
,LHA YI DPAL 'BYOR 'DOD YON LA,
,PHRAG DOG 'GRAN SEMS SKYES PA'I TSE,
,KHYOD RANG LHA RU SKYES PA NA,
,DPAL 'BYOR BDEN GRUB MI 'GYUR BAS,
,KHYOD DANG LHAN CIG GNAS PAR NGES,
,DES NA KHYOD KYIS KHYOD RANG LA,
,PHRAG DOG 'GRAN SEMS BYED DAM CI,

253
Now there within the heart
Of the lesser cousins
Arise different thoughts
Of envy and wanting
To compete with those
Higher pleasure beings
In the treasures they possess,
And the pleasures that they feel.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

這時其餘低報身的生命心中
生起各種嫉妒的念頭
想要與更高的天人去競爭
在他們所擁有的寶物中
感受到喜悅

If the lesser ones die
And get reborn
As one of those very beings,
Remember —
Those treasures existed
In truth, and so
They wouldn't have changed;
And so these beings
Would still now be
Possessed of all of them.
如果其中之一死去
並再次受生
成為這些生靈（天人）的一員，
記住——
那些寶物是真實存在的
因此，它們不會改變；
這些寶物仍然
被這些生靈擁有著

So answer me on this:
What are they supposed to do?
Should they be envious
Of themselves?
Should they each compete
With themselves?
所以請回答我：
他們應該怎麼做呢？
他們應該嫉妒自己嗎？
他們應該與自己競爭嗎？

,LHA YI BDEN 'DZIN 'GYUR MED DANG,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,LHA MIN BDEN 'DZIN 'GYUR MED NA,
,KHYOD NI LHA'AM LHA MIN YIN,
,GZHI MTHUN SHES BYA LA MI SRID,

254

Remember—

According to you,
The habit of a pleasure being
To see things as real
Could never ever change;

記住——

按照你的說法
天人
將事物視為真實
這個習慣
永遠不會改變

And the habit of their

Lesser cousin

To see things as real
Could never ever change.

其餘低報身
將事物視為真實的
習慣
永遠不會改變

And don't forget—

Even according to you,
A single being
Who was at the same time
Both a pleasure being
And the lower cousin
Of that being
Is an utter impossibility.

不要忘記——

即使按照你的說法
一個生命

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

在同一個時刻裡
既是天人
又是低報身的生命
這樣的生命
是完全不可能存在的

,LHA YI BDEN GRUB ZHIG PA'I RJES,
,LHA MIN BDEN GRUB CES ZER NA,
,SKYE 'JIG BDEN GRUB YOD MIN PAS,
,BDEN GRUB GZHAN DU 'GYUR BAS NA,
,KHYOD KYI 'GYUR MED DON DE 'GAL,

255
And suppose you say:
"The way that it works
Is that the true existence
Of the pleasure being
Comes to an end;
And that is followed
By the true existence
Of their lesser cousin."
假設你說：
「輪迴的方式是
天人的一生結束後
跟著就馬上進入
其他五道的報身。」

Well now since
There could never exist
A starting or a stopping
That existed in truth,
And it being the case then
That something that existed
In truth could never change
To something else,
那麼現在既然
那些真實存在的

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

生（開始）或者滅（停止）
從來都不存在，
既然如此
真實存在的東西
就不可能改變為
其他東西，

Then you have neatly
Contradicted
Your own assertion
That these things
Could never change.
那麼你就巧妙地反駁了
自己的斷言——
這些事物
永遠不可能改變

**The impossibility
of a hungry ghost**
餓鬼的不可能性

,KHYOD KYI BDEN GRUB DE LTAR NA,
, 'CHI 'PHO SKYE BA MI SRID KYANG,
,YI DVAGS GNAS SU SKYES PA'I TSE,
,YI DVAGS BKRES SKOM GYIS MNAR BAS,
,KHYOD KYI LHA YI DPAL 'BYOR DE,
,RTAG BRTAN THER ZUG 'GYUR MED NA,
,ZA RGYU MED TSE ZA BAR RIGS,
,LHA ZAS ZOS PAS 'GRANGS PA DE,
, 'GRANGS PA GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR NA,
,DA NI CI YI PHYIR [f. 249b] NA LTOGS,

256
If things exist in truth
The way you hold them to be,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Then it's an impossibility
That anyone could die,
And move on,
And then be born again.
如果事物真實
按照你持有它們的方式而存在，
那麼任何人的死亡，
輪迴，
再次出生
就是一種不可能。

And so if someone did get born
Into the state of a hungry ghost,
And that hungry ghost was being
Tortured by that hunger and thirst,
Then those that had
Nothing to eat
Would eat—
Since the riches they possessed
As the pleasure being before
Are immutable, and solid,
And in and of themselves;
And thus could never change.
如果某人確實投生到
餓鬼道，
被饑餓和口渴所折磨，
沒有任何食物的餓鬼
將會有吃的——
因為以前他們是天人時
擁有的財富
是不變的，也是堅實的，
而且他們本身就是如此，隨身自帶；
因此永遠不會改變。

In fact it would be the case
That the full bellies they possessed
In that life as a pleasure being
Could never change to something other

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Than a belly that was full—
Why then now would they
Ever feel hungry?
事實上，情況就會變成：
他們擁有吃飽的肚子
就像是在天人的那一生，
永遠不會變成
吃飽的肚子
以外的任何樣子——
那麼為何他們現在感到饑餓？

,YI DVAGS LUS KYI BKRES SKOM DE,
,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I 'GYUR MED NA,
,SKYE NAS SKYE BA THAMS CAD DU,
,BKRES SKOM NYID KYI RANG BZHIN LAS,
,GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA MI SRID PAS,
, 'O NI RGYUN PAR BRGYAL LO AANG,
,KHYOD NI DMYAL BAR SKYES PA'I TSE,
,SKYES PA NYID KYIS BDEN GRUB 'GAL,
,DMYAL BA TSA GRANG SDUG BSNGAL DE,
,GSAR DU MYONG BAS SKYE MED 'GAL,

257

And furthermore, it being the case
That things exist in truth,
And thus can never change,
此外，既然
事物是真實存在的，
這樣就永遠不能改變。

Then even if the hungry ghost
Were feeling starved and parched,
Then in all their future lives to live,
In rebirth after rebirth,
那麼即使餓鬼
感到饑餓和口渴，
那麼在他們所有的來生中，

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

在一次接一次的受生中，

It would be an impossibility
For that very hunger and thirst
To change into something else,
And thus waver from its nature.
那樣的饑餓和乾渴變為其他
都將是不可能的，
這樣就動搖了它的本質。

They would continue their collapsing
To the ground in birth after birth,
And eventually find themselves
Born within the hells.
他們將會在一次次的投生中
不斷倒向大地，
最終發現自己
投生到了地獄。

This birth itself would contradict
Your position that they'd been real;
And it would further be a contradiction
For them to have a new experience,
Inside that hell, of the burning
And freezing there.
他的這個出生會否定了
你認為他們是真實的這個觀點；
更為矛盾的是
他們會在地獄裡
有新的體驗，
被烈火灼燒，
被嚴寒冰凍。

,TSA BA'I SDUG BSNGAL MYONG BA'I TSE,
,LHA YI BDE SKYID GANG DU THAL,
,LHA YI SKABS KYI BDE BA DE,
,LTOS MED 'GYUR MED RAG MA LAS,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA MI SRID NA,
,TSA BA'I SDUG BSNGAL CI STE MYONG,

258

And in the moment there
That they began to burn,
They should—according to you—
Be filled with the bliss
Of a pleasure being,
在他們開始被灼燒
的那個時刻
他們應該——按照你的說法——
滿懷著
天人的極樂

Since the pleasure they had
As the being of pleasure before
Was completely independent
Of anything else at all,
And could never change,
And was never conditional.
因為他們以前做天人時
所擁有的快樂
是完全獨立於
其他任何事物的
而且永遠都不會改變，
也永遠不沒有條件。

If, as you say,
It were impossible for that pleasure
To change into anything else,
Then how could they be burned
Here within the hell?
如果，如你所說
這個快樂不可能
變成任何其他感受，
那他們怎麼可能
在地獄裡被灼燒？

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

**Problems of real
pleasure & pain**
真正快樂和痛苦的問題

,BDE SDUG GNYIS PO DNGOS 'GAL NA,
,GZHI GCIG STENG DU CI STE 'DU,
,KHYOD NI LHA LAS 'PHOS MA THAG
,LHA YI BDE BA GZHAN MI 'GYUR,
,LHA YI BDE BA'I RANG BZHIN LAS,
, 'GYUR BA MED CING TSA BA YI,
,SDUG BSNAGAL RANG BZHIN 'GYUR MED PA,
,PHYOGS GCIG 'DU BA MI SRID KYANG,
,BDEN GRUB KHYOD LA 'DU BA NI,
,SNYING TSIM SNYING TSIM DE RE KHYER,
,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I SKYON 'DI LA,
,YON TAN DU BZUNG SNYING RE TSIM,

259

Pleasure and pain
Are mutually exclusive things;
They cannot ever happen
In one person in one moment.
快樂和痛苦
是相互排斥；
它們不可能
同一個時刻在同一個人身上發生。

And according to you,
The pleasure they were feeling
As a being of pleasure
Could not have changed
Into something else
As they moved to another
Type of being.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

按照你的說法
他們感受到的
如同天人般的快樂，
在他們投生到
其他形式的生命時
不會變成其他的感受

So here you have the pleasure
Of a pleasure being
Which can never be altered
From its natural nature;
所以現在你有
天人一般的快樂
它的自然的本質
從來不會改變；

And at the same time you have
The torture of watching your body
Burned within the hell—
Again with a natural nature,
Which cannot change
Into something else.
當你看著自己的身體
在地獄裡灼燒
而倍受折磨的那一刻——
這個自然的本質依舊，
不會變成
其他的感受。

The two could never combine
Within a single person
Within a single moment,
兩者不能夠
在同一個人
同一時刻
合併，

But yes I know

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

You must hang on
To your "truly exist"
And claim they could combine.
但，是的，我知道
你必須堅持
「真實存在」的觀點
並堅稱他們可以合併。

I truly pity you,
That you have to carry the weight
Of all these contradictions;
我真同情你，
必須承受
所有這些矛盾的沉重；

I truly pity the fact
That you feel you must consider
All these different fallacies
As being your badge of honor.
你覺得自己必須將
所有這些各種謬論
視為自己的榮譽勳章，
我對此深表同情。

,GRANG BA'I SDUG BSNGAL MYONG BA DE,
,TSA BA'I SDUG BSNGAL RANG BZHIN DE,
,GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA'I SKABS MED PAS,
,DE DANG LHAN CIG 'GROGS BZHIN DU,
,GRANG BA'I SDUG BSNGAL RANG BZHIN DE,
,RTAG PAR SDOD PA'I THER ZUG PAS,
,SDUG BSNGAL GCIG THOG GCIG BRTZEGS PA,
,TSA GRANG GNYIS PO DNGOS 'GAL DANG,
,RANG BZHIN GNYIS PO DNGOS 'GAL NA,
,NYAMS SU JI LTAR MYONG BAR [f. 250a] 'GYUR,

260

There could never be a chance

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

For the nature of
The pain of cold to transform
Into something else:
Into the nature of
The pain of heat.
永遠不會有這樣的可能性
讓寒冷的疼痛的本性
轉變成其他的感受：
變成灼熱的疼痛的本性。

And so in a case
Where one accompanied the other,
The suffering of either one
Would be stacked upon itself—
Since, after all,
The nature of the pain of cold
Would be a solid one,
Staying that way forever.
在某種情況下
當一個伴隨著另一個時，
遭受其中之一
就會被疊加上來——
因為，歸根結底，
寒冷的痛苦的本質
將是堅實的，
永遠以這種方式停駐。

And then, since the pair
Of hot and cold
Are incompatible—
And since the two natures
Would be incompatible too—
How could we ever undergo
The experience of either one?
然後，因為
灼熱和寒冷這一對
互不相容——
因為這兩種本質

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

也互不相容——
我們如何能夠體驗到
其中之一的呢？

,GZHI GCIG STENG DU JI LTAR 'DU,
, 'GAL KHYAB THAMS CAD KHAS LEN PA'I,
,BDEN GRUB KHYOD LA SNYING RE TSIM,
,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I NYES PA'O,

261

How on earth could the two
Ever come together
In a single place or time?
到底這兩者
如何在同一個地點或時間
同時出現的呢？

It seems you will have
To content yourself
With this little
"Really exists" of yours,
And heartily embrace
All the resulting contradictions
Of believing in it;
這看似符合了
你所說的
小小的「真實存在」，
由於相信
而衷心接納
由此產生的所有矛盾；

For such are the faults
Of anything
That could have this real existence.
因為這就是
這樣真實的存在的
任何事物

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

的錯誤。

**Rebirth
as an impossibility
再生並不可能**

,SKYE MED KHYOD NI GAL TE NA,
,MI LUS CIG NI THOB GYUR TSE,
,MI LUS GSAR DU THOB PA DANG,
,SKYE BA DNGOS SU MTHONG BZHIN DU,
,SKYE BA MED PA'I KHAS LEN MTSAR,

262

What we can say then
Is that, in essence,
You are denying
That anyone could ever
Take birth at all.
那麼我們可以說，
本質上，
你在否認
任何人都可以受生。

And yet all of us can see,
With our very own eyes,
How a person acquires
A human form,
How they come to have
A new human form —
How they come and take
Their birth.
然而，我們所有人都能親眼看到，
人如何獲得了人的形體，
他們是如何擁有新的人形的——
他們是如何來和受生的。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Even so you keep on,
Continuing to insist
That no one takes a birth.
Your ideas are...amazing!
即便如此，
你仍然堅持，
繼續堅稱沒有人受生。
你的想法真是……令人驚歎！

,MA RIG PA YI DON GCIG TSANG,
, 'KHOR BA 'DI LA MTHA' MED PAS,
, 'GRO BA LNGA POR SKYES PA'I TSE,
,RE RE LTAR GYI PHUNG PO LA,
,DMIGS NAS BDEN PAR GRUB PA YI,
, 'DZIN STANGS SO SOR SKYES PA DANG,
,DE YANG LTOS MED 'GYUR MED DANG,
,RAG MA LAS PAR KHYOD ZHEN PA'I,
,ZHEN PA GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR BZHIN,

263
Where this one thing
Stands complete—
Where we misunderstand our world—
The cycle of pain continues on,
The cycle never-ending.
這一點十分徹底——
我們誤解了自己的世界——
讓痛苦的迴圈繼續打轉，
永無止境。

And in it we each are born
Into each of the five different
Forms of life;
在這個迴圈中，
我們每一個
都以五種不同的生命形式出生；

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

And in each individual life
We look upon
Each body and mind
And hold them to exist in truth.
每當個體生命中，
我們會珍視每個身體和心靈，
將其執為真正存在。

It seems as though
The way you grasp to things—
As depending on nothing else at all,
As relying on nothing else there is—
Is as well itself a belief
That will have to be immutable!
似乎你緊抓事物的方式——
就像完全無所依賴，
就像沒有什麼可以依靠——
這本身也是一種信念，
必須不可改變！

, 'DIR YANG PHUNG PO TSOGS TZAM LA,
, BR TEN NAS NGA 'O SNYAM PA YI,
, BLO YI 'DZIN STANGS BDEN GRUB TU,
, SNANG BA LTAR DU KHYOD 'DOD PAS,
, 'GRO BA DRUG PO RE RE LTAR,
, LUS KYI 'DZIN STANGS GZHI GCIG TU,
, 'DU LUGS JI LTAR BYED NA AANG,
, PHAL CHER DNGOS 'GAL ZHUGS PA MANG,

264
What you believe then is that—
When we look at the simple collection
Of the parts that make us up,
And hold it in our minds as "me"—
Then this "me" exists as it seems to:
As something truly there.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

那麼你所相信的是——
當我們看著
自己所組成部分的簡單集合時，
並在意識中將其執持為「我」，
那麼這個「我」就像它看起來那樣存在：
作為真正存在的東西。

How then can you assert
That each of these six
Different kinds of birth
Can exist with a single instance
Of a body as you hold it to be?
那你怎能斷言
這六種不同出生的每一種，
都可以存在於
你所執持的
一個身體的單一實例中呢？

Almost all of your ideas here
Are simply complete contradictions.
幾乎你所有的想法
都是完全矛盾的。

,RNAME PA'ANG PHAL CHER GA LA MTHUN,
,GRO BA DRUG PO THAMS CAD KYI,
,SDUG BSNIGAL TSA GRANG LTAR 'GAL BA'I,
,BZOD PAR DKA' BA'I SDUG BSNIGAL RNAMS,
,BDEN PAR GRUB PA'I LTOS MED DANG,
,GZHAN LA RAG NI MA LAS DANG,
,GYUR MED RTAG BRTAN THEG {%THER} ZUG 'DI,
,KHYOD KYI MI LUS 'DI THOG TU,
,DUS GCIG LA NI JI LTAR MYONG,

265

And how could all their features then
Ever coexist?
那麼，它們的所有特徵

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

怎麼可能共存呢？

All the unbearable sufferings
Of all the six different forms
That living beings take on—
Sufferings that would be
As contradictory in nature
As feelings of hot and cold—
Would be things with a real existence:
所有生命
所承受的六種不同形式的難忍之苦——
在本質上
與冷熱感受一樣矛盾——
都是真實存在的事物：

Never depending, one on another;
Immutable; never-shifting;
Things both concrete and solid.
從不互相依賴；
不可變；不移位；
都是實實在在的事物。

How could it ever be
That you experienced each of them then,
Acting all together,
In this one human form you have?
你怎麼可能體驗到
這每一個，
共同行動，
只在你所擁有的一個人形裡？

,KHYOD KYI LUS LA MYONG NA NI,
,BDEN GRUB 'GYUR BA MED PA 'GAL,
,[f. 250b] DNGOS 'GAL THAMS CAD GZHI MTHUN DU,
,GCIG GI THOG TU 'DU BA 'GAL,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

It's a contradiction for you to claim
That all your bodily experiences
Are real, and that they never change.
你說自己所有的身體體驗都是真實的，
而且永遠不會改變，
這是自相矛盾的。

It's a contradiction for you to claim
That all these things which stand
In direct contradiction to one another
Could ever come together
In a single common object.
你所說的，
所有這些相互直接矛盾的事物，
能夠聚在一起，
成為一個單一共用的物體，
這是自相矛盾的。

Body & mind & me
身體，意識和我

,PHUNG PO TSOGS TZAM LA BR TEN NAS,
,NGA'O SNYAM PA'I BLO DE NI,
,DMIGS PA NGA LA DMIGS NAS NI,
,RNAME PA BDEN PAR GRUB PAR 'DZIN,

267

And so here is a state of mind
Which considers the simple
Combination of body & mind,
And thinks of it as "me."
因此，這裡有一種意識狀態，
認為身體和意識的簡單結合，
即為「我」。

But when it gazes upon this "me,"

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

It grasps to the perception
That it is something that really exists.
但當它凝望這個「我」，
就執取了一種感知，
即認為這是真實存在的。

,DE NI GANG ZAG BDAG 'DZIN YIN,
,DER ZHEN GANG ZAG BDAG ZHEN YIN,
,DE LTAR GRUB NA BDEN GRUB YIN,

268
This is what it means
When we say that a person
Is grasping onto the self-existence
Of the person.
這就是我們所說的
「人執著於自我」的意思。

This is what it means
When we say that a person
Is attached to the idea
Of a self-existent person.
當我們說一個人
執著於一個自性存在的人，
這就是它的意思。

For something to exist this way
Is what we mean
When we say that a thing
Has some true existence.
當我們說事物有某種真實存在時，
某物是以這種方式而存在，
這就是它的意思。

,DE 'DRA'I BLO NI LHAN SKYES LA,
,PHUNG PO LA DMIGS NGA DE NI,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,BDEN PAR GRUB PAR SNANG BA DE,
,SNANG BA LTAR DU GRUB 'DUG NA,
,RTAG PA MTHA' BZUNG TSUL GYIS SU,
,DGAG BYA'I TSAD KYI DGAG RGYU DE,
, 'KHRUL MED NGOS NI ZIN PA NA,
,DE NI DGAG RGYU'I GTZO BO YIN,
,DGRA YI GTZO BO'ANG DE YIN NO,

269

And now suppose it were the case
That the "me" we see
When an inborn state of mind like this
Gazes upon the body & mind
And thinks they exist in truth
Really did exist in truth.

現在假設

我們看到的「我」是這樣一種情況，
當像這樣的一種與生俱來的意識狀態
凝望著身體和心靈，
並認為它們真實存在
且真的真實存在。

That thing then—
This thing that could only exist
In a theoretical sense—
Is the thing we need to deny:
This is the measure
Of what we need to refuse.
那個事物——
這個只能存在於理論意義上的事物，
是我們需要否認的：
這是衡量我們需要拒絕某事的尺度。

If we can identify,
Without any error,
This supposed thing,
Then that itself is the main thing
Which we must seek to deny.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

如果我們能
毫無錯誤地識別出，
這個假想的事物，
那它本身就是
我們必須竭力否認的主要事物。

And it is as well
The face of our true foe.
這也是我們
真正敵人的面目。

,DA DUNG KHYOD LA 'GAL 'DU YI,
,PHUNG PO CHEN PO 'DI LTAR RO,

270
And yet still you cling
To this mighty mountain
Of your own contradictions!
而你們
卻還緊緊抓住
自己矛盾的大山不放！

**A "me" independent
of my body & my mind**
一個獨立於
我的身體和意識的「我」

,DE LTAR GYUR PA'I NGA DE NI,
,PHUNG PO DANG NI RANG NGOS NAS,
,GRUB PA'I GCIG TU GRUB PA'AM,
,GRUB PA'I THA DAD GANG DU GRUB,

271
And let me ask you a question:

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Is this "me" that you believe in
Something that exists, from its own side,
As one and the same
As body & mind?
Or somehow separate from it?
我來問你一個問題：
你所相信的這個「我」，
從它自身而來的存在，
與身體和意識是一體同一的，
還是與之分離？

,GCIG TU GRUB PO ZER NA NI,
,THA DAD GTAN MED GCIG GRUB DANG,
,RANG BZHIN GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR DANG,
,GZHAN LA RAG NI MA LAS DANG,
,LTOS MED 'GYUR MED THER ZUG PAS,

272

Ah! You say this me
Is the same as that body & mind?
啊！你說這個我
和那個身體和意識是一樣的嗎？

Then they must be
A one & the same
Which can never allow
For any degree of separation;
那麼它們
必須是一體同一的，
永遠不能容許
任何程度的分離；

They must be a single thing;
And its nature must never vary,
Even the slightest bit;
And it must never rely
On anything other;

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

它們必須是單一的事物；
且本質永遠不會改變，
哪怕是一丁點兒；
且絕不能
依賴其他任何東西；

It must be solid,
Ever self-standing,
Ever immutable.
它必須是堅固的，
永遠自立，
永恆不變。

,SHI NAS PHUNG PO MER BSREGS SHING,
,THAL BA CHU KLUNG BSKUR BA'I TSE,
,PHUNG PO GTAN MED GYUR PAS NA,
,NGA YANG GTAN MED GYUR TAM CI,

273

Is what you're saying then
Is that when this person dies,
And their body is burned in the fire,
And their ashes thrown
Into the waters of some river,
And the body & mind
Are gone forever,
Then the "me" forever
Disappears as well?
你是說
當這個人死後，
其身體燃燒於火中，
骨灰被扔進河水裡，
其身心永遠消失，
那麼「我」也永遠消失了嗎？

,PHUNG PO DANG NI RANG NGOS NAS,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,GRUB PA'I 'GYUR BA GANG DU SONG,
, 'GYUR BA 'GYUR BA'I 'GYUR MED MTSAR,

274

Where then is it
That the body & mind,
And the change that they
Have passed through—
Coming as it does,
From its very own side—
Have all gone off to?
那麼，身體和意識，
以及它們所經歷的改變——
從它自身的角度，
都去了哪裡？

This changeless
Change of changing of yours
Is truly a wondrous thing!
你的改變的
這種不變的變化，
真的是一件奇異的事情！

**Problems with the idea
of aging & dying**
關於衰老
和死亡的問題

,PHUNG PO 'DI DANG LHAN CIG TU,
, 'GYUR MED RTAG PAR BDEN GRUB NA,
,SHI BA'I THA SNYAD GA LA BYED,
, 'CHI BA MED NA SKYE BA MED,
,RGA DANG NA SOGS [f. 251a] GA NA MCHIS,

275

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

If this "me" is something
That exists in truth,
Forever unchanging,
Part & parcel
With body & mind,
Then how on earth
Could you even talk of it
As something that could die?
如果這個「我」
是真實存在的，
永遠不變的，
是身體和意識的組成部分，
那麼你怎能
把它說成是會死的東西？

And if somebody never dies,
Then neither were they ever born—
And how then could we say
That they suffered growing old,
And illness and all the rest?
如果有人不死，
那麼也不會出生——
那麼我們又怎麼能說
其經歷過衰老、
疾病和其他的痛苦呢？

,YANG GCIG CHOS KUN MED PA KHYOD,
,SKYE 'CHI YOD NA BDEN GRUB MED,
,KHYOD KYI LUGS LA CHOS KUN NI,
,STOS {%LTOS} MED 'GYUR BA MED PAR GRUB,
,PHAN TSUN LTOS GRUB CHOS MED PAS,
,DES NA KHYOD LA CHOS KUN MED,

276

And if this one-and-the-same me
That was none of everything there is
Could be born, and could then die,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Then it wouldn't any more exist
As that kind of real
That you were talking about!
如果這個一體同一的我
不是世上任何可以出生，
然後死亡的事物，
那麼它就不會
像你所說的那樣真實存在！

According to your system,
Every single thing in the universe
Exists in a way where it need not depend
On anything else in the universe—
In a way where it never changes.
按照你的體系，
宇宙中的每一個事物
都以一種不需要依賴於
任何其他事物的方式存在——
這種方式永遠不會改變。

According to you, there cannot exist
Any objects which stand
In dependence upon each other;
照你的說法，
不可能存在
任何相互依賴的物體；

And so what you're really saying
Is that there cannot exist
Any objects at all in the universe!
所以你真正想說的是
宇宙中根本不可能
存在任何物體！

,GZHAN DU 'GYUR LA MI 'GYUR ZER,
,KHYOD NI MA RIG RANG DU 'DUG
,DE YI NANG NAS RANG MA RIG

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

277

When you make your claim
That things which change
Into other things never do,
當你聲稱，
那些變為其他事物的事物
永遠不會發生改變。

It shows that you have really
Gone and made your home
In a state of misunderstanding;
這表明你確實已經走遠，
在一種誤解的狀態下安家了；

And even within that house
You tend to stay in the room
Called "misunderstanding myself."
即使在那所房子裡，
你也傾向於
待了一個叫做「誤解自己」的房間裡。

**Problems of conversing
with stones**
與石頭對談的問題

,KHYOD NI 'GRO BA GZHAN SKYES TSE,
,DE YI PHUNG DANG NGA GNYIS NI,
,BDEN PA'I GCIG TU GRUB DGOS PAS,
,PHUNG PO 'DI LA DMIGS NAS NI,
, 'GRO BA GZHAN GYI PHUNG PO LA'ANG,
,NGA'O SNYAM PA'I BLO SKYE DGOS,

278

When the time comes for you

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

To take your birth into a different life,
Then your "me" and the body & mind
That exist there in that new life
Are going to have to exist
As a single thing that is also real.
當你受生為不同的生命狀態，
你的小「我」以及新生命狀態中的身心
都將作為一個獨立個體存在於此，
這是真的。

And then even when you sit and look
At this body & mind that belong
To another world, another form of life,
It's going to have to pop into
Your thoughts: "Oh, that is me!"
然後，即使你坐下來看著
這個屬於另一個世界，另一種生命形式的身心，
腦海中會突然冒出「哦，那是我！」

,DES NA 'GRO GZHAN PHUNG PO DE,
,PHUNG PO 'DI THOG YOD DGOS PAS,
,MED KYANG LHAN CIG TSOGS PA 'DI,
,DNGOS 'GAL BYUNG YANG MA RIG PA,
,KHYOD DANG LHAN CIG RTZOD PA 'DI,
,SMYON PA NGAG {%or DAG? check another carving} DANG RTZOD PA 'DRA,

279

And then it's going to have
To be the case
That this body & mind
In a different world
Exists stacked on top
Of the body & mind
That you possess now.
必然會出現
這樣的情況，
這個身體和意識

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

在不同的世界裡
存在於
你現在的身心之上。

And then you'll experience
A great new contradiction,
Where things that can't exist
In the first place are suddenly
Stacked upon each other.

此後你會經歷
一個很大的新矛盾——
原本不可能存在的事物
忽然間蜂擁而來。

Mr. Misunderstanding,
I have to say
That having a debate with you
Is something like discussing the truth
With a person who's gone mad!
誤解先生，
我不得不說，
和你辯論
就像是和一個發瘋的人
討論真相一樣！

,LABS PA LA NI KHYAD MED PAS,
,YANG NA RDO DANG RTZOD PA 'DRA,
,KHYOD NI RDO LAS CHES LOD PA,
,RDO LA BZO BCOS CI BYAS NYAN,

280
Since talking to you
Doesn't seem
To make any difference at all,
因為和你談論沒有任何區別，

We could also say

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

That debating with you
Is like arguing with a stone;
也可以說和你辯論就像是和石頭在爭論；

Except that the quality
Of your thinking
Is infinitely worse
Than that of a stone.
What adjustment
Could one ever make
To a stone to help it
Listen better?
只不過你的思想品格
比石頭還糟糕得多。
一個人能對一塊石頭
做怎樣的調教
來幫助它更好的傾聽？

**And how does death work,
anyway?**
那麼死亡到底是如何運作的？

,CI MI NYAN PA'I MA RIG PA,
,SHI BA KHYOD LA YOD MA YIN,
,GAL TE SHI NAS GZHAN SKYES TSE,
,GAL TE SKYES TSE KHYOD PHUNG DANG,
,BRAL MED BDEN PAR GNAS DGOS DANG,
,SPYIR DU 'CHIB {% 'CHI BA} GA LA BYED,

281
The fact of death,
According to you—
Sir Misunderstanding,
Who cannot listen to anything—
Could not in fact exist.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

死亡這件事，
根據你——
根本什麼都不聽的——
誤解先生的理解——
事實上是不可能存在的。

If once you had died
You were born as something else;
And if when you were born
As that something else,
You had to live on
As something that was real,
And indivisible from
Your body & mind;
如果一旦你死了，
你就會投生為另一種東西；
如果你生來就是另一種東西，
就不得不作為那個真實的、
與你的身心不可分割的事物而活著；

Then how could we ever speak,
Even in general terms,
Of the fact of death itself?
即使是籠統地說，
我們又如何能夠
說出死亡這件事本身呢？

,SGOS SU PHUNG PO 'DI KHYER NAS,
,GZHAN GYI MA YI MNGAL DU NI,
,BDEN PAR SKYE LUGS JI LTAR BYED,
,PHUNG PO 'DI BCAS ZHUGS SAM CI,

282

If you take your own
Personal body & mind
And carry it with you
Into the womb

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Of someone else's mother,
如果你將自己的
身體和意識
帶入他人母親的
子宮，

And thus take a birth
In a way that is real,
Just how does that work?
Have you gone in there
With this very same
Body & mind?
從而以一種真實的方式
出生
這是怎麼回事？
你可曾
帶著這具身心
去到那裡？

,DE BZHIN ZHUGS PAR GYUR ZER KYANG,
,ZHUGS PA'I 'GYUR BA KHO NAS NI,
,BDEN GRUB 'GYUR BA MED PA 'GAL,

283
And suppose you claim
That this exactly the way
That you have entered there;
Isn't it though the case
That the change involved
In having entered
Contradicts your position
Of immutable self-existence?
假設
這正是使你
進入他人子宮的方式；
難道不正是
這個變化

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

涉及到了
與你不可改變的自性存在的立場
的矛盾嗎？

,PHUNG PO BZHAG NAS [f. 251b] SKYE NA NI,
,SKYE BA KHO NAS BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

284
And even if what really happens
Is that you leave behind
This body & mind
And go and take your birth,
即使真正發生的是
你離開了這具身體和意識
再次出生，

That very fact of being born
Already contradicts
This idea of real existence.
出生這個事實
已經與
真實存在這個觀念
相互矛盾了。

Moving on
from "me" to "mine"
從「我」轉向「我的」

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG GRUB NA,
,NGA YI BA LA DMIGS PA YI,
,NGA YIR 'DZIN PA KHYOD LA MED,

285
If "me" is something that is

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Really one and the same
With the body and the mind,
Then according to you
It would never be possible
To hold to something as "mine"
In the sense of focusing
On those things that are mine.
如果「我」
與身體和意識是一體的，
按照你的說法，
就專注於那些我的東西的意義上而言，
永遠不可能
把某件東西作為「我的」。

,GAL TE NGA YIR 'DZIN ZHE NA,
,BDEN GRUB GZHAN DU 'GYUR BAS NA,
, 'GYUR BA MED PA'I BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

286
And if you say
That it really *is* possible
To hold to something as "mine,"
Then a thing that exists as real
Has changed into something else—
Thus contradicting your idea
Of a self-existent existence
Impossible to change.
如果真的有可能將某物視為「我的」，
那麼，一個真實存在的東西
變成另一個東西——
與你認為的自性存在的東西不可改變的理念
存在相互矛盾。

,NGA YI LAG PA LA DMIGS PA'I,
,NGA YI BA YI BDEN GRUB DE,
, 'GYUR BA MED PA'I RTAG PAR DANG,

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,LTOS MED GZHAN LA RAG MA LAS,

287

The real existence of a mine
Where you focus on *my* hand
Would have to be unchanging;
Something that never varied,
Never depending, never relying
On anything else at all.
當你把注意力放在我的手上，
「我的」的真實存在感
必須是不變的；
它是永遠不會變化，
不依緣而生，
永遠不會依賴於任何事物的
某種事物。

,NGO BOS GRUB PA'I 'GYUR MED DANG,
,NGA YI RKANG SOGS LA DMIGS PA'I,
,NGA YIR 'DZIN PA SKYE BA 'GAL,

288

A changelessness
That existed in and of itself
Would contradict the very idea
Of a perception starting up
That was focused upon *my* leg,
Or anything else of the like.
存在於內在與自身的
不變性，
與一種聚焦於我的腿
或其他類似的東西
所升起的感知
相互矛盾。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Problems with the shifts

in attraction

吸引力轉移的問題

,GAL TE BLO NI SKYES PA NA,
,BDEN PA GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA DANG,
,SKYE BA KHO NAS 'GYUR MED 'GAL,
,BDEN PAS TSUGS NI MA THUB PO,

289

As soon as we get a single thought,
Then reality undergoes a change;
This and the simple fact of starting
Contradict the idea of changelessness.
Something that was really real
Could never stand on its own.

只要我們有個想法，
現實就會發生變化；
這點以及「生」這個簡單的事實
與不變性這一理念相矛盾。
真正真實的東西
永遠無法獨立存在。

,DE BZHIN CHAGS PA'I BDEN GRUB DE,
,GZHAN DU MI 'GYUR THER ZUG PAS,
,DI MIN KUN LA 'GROS 'DI KHYER,

290

So too, a real reality
In the form of feeling attachment
Would be something that was solid,
And never open to change.
You should think about
The effect this would have
On the idea that everyone
Likes to talk about:

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

"Freedom from attachment."

同樣，以情感依戀的形式出現的
現實

也是牢固的，

永遠不想要改變。

想想這對於

每個人都喜歡談論的「擺脫依戀」

這一理念所帶來的影響。

,BUD MED LTA BU LA DMIGS NAS,
,MIG GIS GZUGS LA CHAGS PA YI,
,YID 'ONG DNGOS PO GZHAN DAG LA,
,BDEN PA'I CHAGS PA SKYE BA 'GAL,
,GAL TE SKYE NA 'GYUR MED 'GAL,
,SKYE BA KHO NAS BDEN GRUB 'GAL,

291

It would be a contradiction then

To say that a man had looked

At something like a woman

And felt attraction to her form,

And then begun to feel as well

An attraction that was real

Towards any other

Alluring object at all;

If the attraction began to be felt,

Then that would contradict

The idea that it was real;

If something even begins at all,

Then that contradicts

The idea that things are immutable;

And so we can say

That it takes no more

Than something starting

To contradict your idea

That things could exist as real.

我們說一個男人看著

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

一個像女人一樣的東西
感覺到了吸引力，
又開始對
任何有吸引力的物件
感受到真正的吸引力，
那就自相矛盾了；
如果這種吸引力開始被感覺到，
這將與「它是真實的」想法
相矛盾；
如果某事真的開始了，
那就與事物是不可改變的觀點
相互矛盾；
所以我們可以說
只需要用某事的「生」
即可反駁你的觀點，
即事物能真實的存在。

,DE BZHIN DBANG PO GZHAN DAG LA'ANG,
,SO SOR CHAGS YUL LA DMIGS PA'I,
,BDEN PA'I CHAGS PA SKYE BA 'GAL,
,GAL TE SKYE NA SKYE MED 'GAL,
,BDEN GRUB GZHAN DU 'GYUR BA'ANG 'GAL,

292

The same reasoning applies
To a case where any other
Organ of the sense might focus
On an object of attraction:
同樣的推理也適用於
其他感官可能聚焦於
吸引的物件
這種情形：

It would be a contradiction
To say that the attraction was real.
如果說吸引力是真的
就有矛盾了。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

And if the attraction started up,
Then that would contradict the idea
That nothing could ever start:
It would be a contradiction even if
A thing that really existed
Could change to something else.
如果吸引力產生了，
這將與沒有什麼會「生」
這一想法相矛盾；
即使一個真正存在的東西
可以變成另一個東西，
這也是一種矛盾。

,DANG PO THOG MA MED DUS NAS,
,MIG GI DBANG PO'I YUL DAG LA,
,BDEN PA'I CHAGS PA LTOS MED DU,
,GRUB GRUB PAR NI YOD ZER NA,

293
And suppose you say
That it's the case
That from the very beginning,
From the very start of things,
There have always been
Feelings of attraction
To the objects of
The sense power of the eye
That were real;
That since forever these feelings
Have always existed,
Without depending on anything else.
假設從一開始，
從萬物的本初，
眼睛的感官力（眼識）
對其對象
總有吸引力的感覺

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

這是真實的；
從恒久以來這些感覺
一直存在
不依賴於任何事物。

Problems with kids & fogeys
孩子與老傢伙的問題

,’O NA PHUNG PO ’DI YANG NI,
,DANG PO THOG MA MED DUS NAS,
,LTOS [f. 252a] MED GRUB PAR YOD DAM CI,

294
Well then, are you saying
That this particular body & mind
Has also existed—
Since the very first days,
For time with no beginning,
Independent of anything else?
那麼，你難道是在說，
這個特殊的身體和意識
從無始以來的最初也已經存在，
並且獨立於任何其他的事物？

,YOD NA ’GRO BA GZHAN LNGA RU,
,SKYE BA MED PAS KHYOD LA ’GAL,
,MI LUS TSE ’DIR ’PHRAL BLANGS BZHIN,
,THOG MED GRUB PA’I KHAS LEN ’GAL,

295
And if so, then since
There should never have been
Any births into any of the other
Of the five different forms of life,
You contradict yourself.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

若是如此，那麼
既然這五種不同生命形式中的
任何一種都不應該誕生，
你就自相矛盾了。

You contradict the fact
That for time without beginning
We have taken on these births,
你駁斥了這樣一個事實：
無始以來
我們經歷這些誕生，

In just the same way
That in this present moment
We have slipped on a human body
Here within this life.
以同樣的方式，在這個當下，
我們今生呈現為一具人類的身體。

,BU CHUNG NAS NI RIM PAR NI,
,RGAN PO'I LUS SU GYUR BZHIN DU,
,THOG MED DUS NAS RGAN PO'I LUS,
, 'DI GA BCOS MIN LTOS MED DU,
,GRUB PA'I KHAS LEN 'DI 'DRA AANG,
,MA RIG YIN KYANG GAD MO 'CHOR,

296
Our bodies transform,
Step by step,
From the form of a child
Into that of the aged.
我們的身體，
一步一步地蛻變，
從孩子變成老人。

How then can you
Take the position

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

That this same body
Of the elderly one
Has existed for time
Without a beginning,
Never refreshed,
Existing in and of itself?
那麼你怎能持這一立場：
將這具老人的身體
視作無始以來就存在，
且從未更新過，
只是存在於其自身之中？

Yes, we know —
It's just your misunderstanding,
But how can we keep
A burst of laughter
From escaping out our lips?
是的，我們知道——
這只是你的誤解，
但我們怎樣才能忍住，
不讓嘲笑從嘴唇逃逸？

,AA MAR SKYES PA YIN BZHIN DU,
,GYUR MED RGAN PO'I RANG BZHIN DU,
,GRUB GRUB 'DRA BA 'DI GAR NA,
,RGAN POR AA MA'I LUS SU NI,
,ZHUGS PA'I TSUL 'DI KHYOD KYIS SMROS,

297
On one hand then
You have somebody
Taking birth inside their mother;
一方面，
你說有個人從其母親體內出生；

Who on the other hand
Keeps going on

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

In the form of a fogey unchanged.
而另一方面，
他又保持一個老傢伙的形象，毫不變樣。

Tell us now
Just how this works:
Someone here who's elderly,
And who's entered into
The body of their mother!
現在，告訴我們，
這怎麼做到：
一個（不變的）老人，
同時又曾進入了媽媽身體裡！

A list of different "mines"
各種「我的」清單

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG GRUB NA,
,PHUNG PO LA CHAGS BDEN 'DZIN DE,
, 'GYUR BA MED PAS SEMS LA NI,
,BDEN 'DZIN CI YI PHYIR NA SKYE,

298
If the "me" really is
One and the same
With my body and mind
In a way which is real,
如果「我」真實存在
且真的與我的身體和意識
是同一個東西，

Then our habit of grasping
To some true existence
Of our body and our mind
Would have to be unchangeable.
那麼我們執著於

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

自己的身體和意識
是真實存在的這一習慣，
就必是不可改變的。

How then could we ever begin
To have in our mind fresh ideas
Of holding things as true?
那麼我們的意識中怎麼能
開始產生新的想法，
認為事物是真實的？

,SKYE NA GZHAN 'GYUR MED PA 'GAL,
,SKYE BA MED PA'I DON DANG 'GAL,
,KUN LA 'DI YI RIGS BSGRES NA,
, 'DI 'DRA'I RIGS LA ZAD MTHA' MED,

299
If those ideas did begin,
Then that would contradict
Your idea that nothing could ever
Change into something else.
如果這些想法真的開始產生了，
那麼這就會與你的如下想法相矛盾，
即任何事物都不可能變成其他事物。

It would contradict
Your idea
That none of these would start.
這也會與你的如下想法相矛盾，
即這些全都不會開始。

And since this same logic applies
Equally to every other thing there is,
The things that are really endless
Are the applications of these thoughts.
而且，由於這個邏輯
也同樣適用於所有其他事物，

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

所以真正無窮盡的事物
正是這些念頭的應用。

,NGA DANG PHUNG PO BDEN PA YI,
,THA DAD DU NI GRUB PA NA,
,BREL MED DON GZHAN YIN DGOS PAS,
,LAG PA NA YANG NGA NA ZHES,
,BDAG GIR BYED PA 'BREL MED YIN,

300

And now suppose instead
That the "me" existed as something
Which was separate, in truth,
From the body and the mind.
現在，
假設「我」真實存在，
而且與身體和意識是分開的。

In this case, this "me"
And body & mind would have to be
Completely unrelated, separate things.
在這種情況下，
這個「我」，
就必須是與身體和意識
完全不相關的、獨立的事物。

And then it would be
Completely irrelevant
To consider anything as my own:
To say, when I hurt my hand,
That I had hurt myself.
那麼，把任何事物看作是我自己的
就完全不恰當：
比如說，當我傷了我的手，
我就傷了我自己。

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

,NGA YI MGO DANG NGA YI KHA,
,NGA YI SNA RTZE MIG DBANG SOGS,
,NGA YI LUS DANG NGA YI GROD,
,NGA YI RKED TSIGS PUS MO DANG,
,NGA YI LTO SKOM GOS LA SOGS,
,NGA YI ZHING KHANG NGA YI GA-YOG
,NGA YI CHUNG MA BU SOGS DANG,
,NGA YI DNGOS PO THAMS CAD LA,
,DMIGS NAS NGA YIR 'DZIN PA YI,
,BLO NI SKYE BA [f. 252b] 'BREL MED YIN,

301

So too would it become
Completely irrelevant
To ever begin to feel a thought
Where we considered a thing
And held it to be mine;

所以，

當開始感覺到如下這個念頭，
即我們認為一個事物是「我的」，
這也會變得完全不恰當；

For none of them would ever be
My head, my mouth,
The tip of my nose,
The senses of my eyes,
My whole body, or my belly,
Or my spine, or knees,
The hunger in my stomach,
The clothes upon my back;

因為它們都從來不會是
我的頭、我的嘴、
我的鼻尖、我眼睛的感覺、
我的整個身體或腹部、
或者我的脊柱或膝蓋、
我胃裡的饑餓感、
我背上的衣服；

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

My fields, my house,
The ones who work for me;
我的田地、我的房子、我的雇員；

My wife, my children,
My anything else—
Each and every thing of mine.
我的妻子、我的孩子、
我其他的一切——
我所有的東西，每一個東西。

,BDEN PA'I 'BREL MED DON GZHAN LA,
, 'BREL BA GTAN MED AA THANG CHAD,
,BDEN 'DZIN DANG NI SHES RAB BZHIN,
,LHAN CIG GNAS PA'I SKABS MED PAS,

302
And don't keep telling me
That if a connection isn't real,
Then there's no connection at all—
You wear my patience thin!
不要一直告訴我
一個關聯不是真實的，
根本就沒有關聯——
你把我的耐心耗盡了！

According to you,
It would have to be meaningless
For us ever to look at a thing
That was mine, and think
That it was mine,
根據你的說法，
當看著屬於我的某個事物，
並且認為它是我的，
這是毫無意義的。

Since me and the thing—

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

Like the habit of grasping
To things as real, and Wisdom herself—
Could never live together
Within a single place.
因為我和那個事物——
就像執著於事物是真實的這個習慣，
以及智慧本身——
永遠都無法共處於一處。

,NGA YI BA LA DMIGS PA YI,
,NGA YIR 'DZIN PA'I DON MED PAS,
,NGA YI BA LA BDAG GIR NI,
,BYED PA MA RIG KHYOD LA 'GAL,
, 'GAL YANG BYED NA RGYU MTSAN MED,
,DE BAS KHA ROG 'DUG NA DGA',

303

Since there's no point
In looking at the things that are mine
And considering them to be mine,
既然看著我的某些事物
並認為它們是我的
毫無意義，

It's a contradiction,
Mr. Misunderstanding,
For you to claim the things
That are "mine" for you
As being yours.
那麼，誤解先生，
你把「我的」事物說成是你的
就是自相矛盾的。

And there's not much point
To keep on doing the same thing
Where it's a blatant contradiction.
在明顯矛盾的情況下

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

繼續做同樣的事情
沒有多大意義。

I think maybe
You should take a break,
And sit still for a bit.
我想也許你應該休息一下，
靜靜地坐一會兒。

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I DU MAR NI,
,GRUB NA NGA PHUNG BDEN PA YI,
,GCIG TU GRUB PAR 'GYUR BA YIN,

304
If what I consider "me"
Is, in truth, the many parts
Of my body & mind,
Then my "me" must also be
A single thing with body & mind.
事實上，如果我認為的「我」
是我身體和意識的許多個部分，
那麼我的「我」也必須是
一個有身體和意識的東西。

Some scripture in support
經典支持

,RGYU MTSAN RIN CHEN PHRENG BA LAS,
,GCIG MED PHYIR NA DU MA DANG,
,ZHES DANG GZHAN YANG DU MA NI,
,YOD NA GCIG KYANG YOD DGOS SO,

304
The reason for this
Can be found

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

In the *String of Precious Jewels*,
Where it speaks of things
Not being more than one,
Since they are not one.
其原因可以在《寶鬘論》中找到，
該經典中提到，
因為事物不是一個，
所以它們也不多於一個。

And in any case,
If there could ever be more than one,
There would have to be
A one as well.
無論如何，
如果可能多於一個，
那麼肯定也必須是一個。

,NGA DANG PHUNG PO GCIG PAR THAL,
,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG YIN PHYIR,
,DOD NA DBU MA 'JUG PAR BKAG

305
And isn't it the case
That the "me" and my body & mind
Are one and the same?
Because the "me" and my body & mind
Are a one and the same that's real.
難道，
「我」和我的身體及意識
不是完全相同的東西嗎？
因為「我」和我的身體及意識
是完全相同的、真實的東西。

Oh you may agree to it;
But *Entering the Middle Way*
Proves that idea wrong.
噢，你也許會同意這一點；

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

但《入中論》證明了
這個觀點是錯誤的。

**Problems with splitting
the me's and mine's**
把「我」和「我的」分開
會產生的問題

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I GCIG GRUB NA,
,PHUNG PO'I CHA SHAS KUN DANG NI,
,BDEN PA'I GCIG TU GRUB DGOS PAS,
,SHAR NUB LHO BYANG DBUS DBYE BA'I,
,PHYOGS NI GANG DU GCIG PAR 'GYUR,

306

If the "me" were,
In reality,
One with my body & mind,
在現實中，
如果「我」是我的身體和意識，

Then the "me" would have to be,
In reality,
One with each and every one
Of the separate parts of body & mind.
那麼在現實中，
「我」就必須是
身體和意識的每一個獨立的部分。

And then the "me" would be
One with each of the separate
Directions of east, and west,
South, and north, and middle.
那麼「我」就會是
東、西、南、北、中

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

的每一個單獨的方向。

,DBUS CHAR MTSON NAS GCIG NA NI,
,DE LA'ANG SHAR NUB DBUS DBYE'O,

307

And then the same with,
For example,
The parts of the middle itself;
For it too can be divided
Into its own east & west & middle.
那麼，舉例來說，
「中」本身的各個部分也一樣；
因為它也可以被分割為
它自己的東、西和中。

,DE BZHIN THA MAR RDUL PHRAN NI,
,LCAGS RDUL TZAM DU GSIL BA'I TSE,
,RDUL MED MA GYUR BAR DU NI,
,GSIL BA'I TSE NA BDEN 'DZIN KHYOD,
,BDEN PA'I GCIG TU SU DANG 'GROGS,

308

And it would be the same
As well all the way down
To the tiny atoms of stuff:
並且一路下來，
小到物質的微小原子
也都是一樣的：

Suppose you reduced things
Down to iron particles,
And then all the way past that
To the point where
There would no longer be
Any particle at all.

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

假設你把事物縮小成鐵粒子，
然後一直縮小
直到連任何粒子也不再有的地步。

What real single one is it then,
My Friend Who Grasps to Real,
That you relate yourself to
When things are reduced to that?
那麼，我的朋友，
你執著於真實，
而當事物被削減那個地步時，
你所執著的「自己」又是怎樣的一個真實的個體？

,NGA PHUNG BDEN PA'I RANG BZHIN DU,
,GYUR BA MED PA GANG DU SONG,
,GYUR GYIN 'GYUR GYIN MI 'GYUR ZER,
,DI 'DRA'I BDEN GRUB YA MTSAN CAN,,

309

Where then would your "me"
Run off to—the one
That was unchangeable,
And truly in nature body & mind?
那麼你的「我」跑到哪裡去了呢？
那個不可改變的、
真實存在於身體和意識中的東西。

Oh this real existence of yours—
The kind that's always changing,
And then changing over again—
But which still you say is changeless,
Is truly something amazing!
噢，「你的」的真實存在——
總是在變化，反復在變化——
但你仍然說是不變的，
真是不可思議！

Stepping into Our Next World
Session 15 of "The Angel Debates the Devil"
走進我們的下一個世界
第15 學期《天使與魔鬼之辯》

**Mr. Misunderstanding
defends himself**
誤解先生為自己辯解

„BDEN ‘DZIN GYIS [f. 253a] NI LAN SMRAS PA,

310

And then the Habit
of Seeing Things as Real replied—
然後，
將事物視為真實的習慣回應道——